STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

Sunnycrest Center 1717 Philo Road, Suite 24 Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099



James D. Montgomery

Merit Board Chair

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock

Executive Director

April 22, 2015

Dr. Elaine Maimon
President
Governors State University

Ms. Karen Kissel
Vice President for Administration and Finance
Governors State University

Ms. Joyce Coleman
Associate Vice President for Human Resources and Diversity
Designated Employer Representative
Governors State University

Mr. David Dixon Internal Auditor Governors State University

Mr. James D. Montgomery Merit Board Chair State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. Brian D. Mitchell
Merit Board Member
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at the Governors State University. The audit period tested was April 1, 2012 through March 31, 2014. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Governors State University and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 236.

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock Executive Director

Governors State University Final Audit Report



State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

April 22, 2015

April 1, 2012 – March 31, 2014

Prepared by:

Zuinda M. Neitzel

Lucinda M. Neitze

Assistant Director, Operations and Audit Division

Governors State University <u>Final Audit Report</u>

Table of Contents

| Introduction | |
|------------------------|---|
| Executive Summary. | 4 |
| <u> </u> | commendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional ts5 |
| Appendices Appendix A: | Principal Administrative Appointments: Position Descriptions Matching Civi Service Specifications |
| Appendix B: | Principal Administrative Appointments – Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with Triennial Review Standards |
| Appendix C: | Extra Help Employees Exceeding 900-Hour Rule |
| Appendix D: | Extra Help Positions Exceeding 900-Hour Rule |
| Appendix E: | Civil Service Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with Cyclic Review Standards |

Governors State University Final Audit Report

Introduction

PURPOSE

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) (110 ILCS 70/36b(3)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting "ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 III. Adm. Code 250)] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers" (80 III. Adm. Code §250.140(c)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted August 5-7, 2015. A Formal Exit Conference was conducted on March 23, 2015, which provided an opportunity for the Employer to discuss the findings contained in the initial Draft Audit Report. Upon completion of the exit conference and submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and a Supplemental Report (Non-Material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office, if applicable, for internal use.

OVERVIEW

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material Findings in this report:

Assignment of Positions to Classes

The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer's position audit process and corresponding determinations.

• Compensation Programs

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer's use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer's compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

• Examination Program

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Operations and Audit Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

Lucinda Neitzel, Assistant Director, Operations and Audit Division Danielle Routh, Program Coordinator, Operations and Audit Division Jeff Brownfield, Coordinator, Special Assignments

Governors State University <u>Final Audit Report</u>

Executive Summary YEAR ENDED-FY2015

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) (80 III. Adm. Code 250), State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals, applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

| Number of | <u>This Report</u> |
|--|--------------------|
| Findings | 4 |
| Repeated findings from previous audit® | 2 ® |

SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

| Item <u>Number</u> | <u>Page</u> | <u>Description</u> |
|-----------------------|-------------|---|
| GSU FY15-01 | 5 | FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications® |
| GSU FY15-02 | 9 | FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Principal Administrative Appointments – Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with Triennial Review Standards |
| GSU FY15-03 | 11 | FINDINGS (ILLINOIS ADMINISTRATIVE CODE) Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations® |
| GSU FY15-04 | 15 | FINDINGS (SUCSS PROCEDURE MANUALS) Civil Service Appointments – Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with Cyclic Review Standards |

Governors State University <u>Final Audit Report</u>

Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan and Additional Auditor Comments

GSU FY15-01 Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) State Universities Civil Service Act (Act), Section 70/36e Coverage
- 2) Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.30(a) Coverage
- 3) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview
- 4) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1 Principal Administrative Appointments
- 5) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review
- 6) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3) of the Act, the Employer may be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

Through a review of approximately sixty (60) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that thirty-four (34) exempted positions listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. The positions cited simply do not contain the duties or level of authority and responsibility that would typically fall outside the specifications of standard professional or technical Civil Service classifications.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

According to the Employer's payroll records, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions. Additionally, it appears that routine reviews and updates of some position descriptions do not occur on a regular or routine basis. An additional finding related to the position description update log is cited separately in this report.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

Finding from Previous Audit:

During the FY2011 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Auditor identified eleven (11) exempted positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classifications. [Finding Code GSU FY11-02, pages 9-12].

During the FY2013 Biennial Compliance Audit, through a review of approximately fifty-nine (59) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that fifteen (15) exempted positions were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. [Finding Code GSU FY13-01, pages 5-8].

Recommendation:

Due to the level of non-compliance related to this topic, the Employer is again reminded that exemption authorization is a direct statutory responsibility delegated to the Merit Board, who has specifically empowered Employers through various procedures to make these exemption determinations. The Designated Employer Representative (DER) of each university and

affiliated agency has the responsibility to develop and maintain protocols consistent with the statutory and procedural guidelines related to this important delegated authority.

The Illinois Administrative Code, Section 250.30(a) specifically provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institution or agency. Specifically, it states that "The Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board." We refer the Employer to these guidelines located in the Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1, Principal Administrative Appointments and Section 4.1, Teaching, Research, and Extension Faculty Appointments, approved by the Merit Board in June 2009. In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in these standards, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing standard titles. Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance, and benefit administration.

Based on a regular position review, the Employer should be able to properly identify those positions that truly should be a Civil Service appointment of some type and those positions that truly meet exemption authorization standards, either as a Principal Administrative Appointment or as a Teaching, Research, or Extension Faculty Appointment. The Employer is asked to re-examine internal job analysis protocols to insure proper position description maintenance and analysis to validate exemption determinations. The Employer is also asked to submit a quarterly report listing all new exempt PAA positions that have been employed within that time frame, along with the position description utilized in validating each exemption.

Please be reminded that positions determined to be inappropriately exempted and flagged through the compliance audit process <u>must be reviewed</u> as a matter of standard protocol at the next contract renewal date. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible. It is strongly recommended that positions designated to be transitioned to Civil Service appointments be moved as soon as possible, preferably at the next employment contract renewal date, but certainly no later than at such time that these positions become vacant again. We refer the Employer to the <u>Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position</u> for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments. Again, please note that positions designated for transition through the audit process will be reviewed in the next biennial audit process and must be monitored by the Employer periodically.

As previously discussed with the Employer, the former Pilot Program classifications (Custom Classifications) have been incorporated into our classification plan and are required to be utilized in accordance with standardized civil service protocols. These classifications provide a more flexible and transparent transition and may be appropriate for several of the positions

cited in **Appendix A**. Again, it is strongly recommended that these positions be moved immediately, or at the next employment contract renewal date if applicable.

<u>Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Joyce Coleman, Associate Vice President for Human Resources and Diversity</u>

We will review the positions cited in Appendix A when they become vacant.

Additional Auditor Comments:

As previously referenced in the recommendation to this finding, the Employer is again asked to submit a quarterly report listing all new exempt PAA positions that have been employed within that time frame, along with the position description utilized in validating each exemption.

Governors State University <u>Final Audit Report</u>

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

GSU FY15-02 Principal Administrative Appointments – Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with Triennial Review Standards

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) State Universities Civil Service Act (Act), Section 70/36e Coverage
- 2) Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.30(a) Coverage
- 3) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview
- 4) Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review

The Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review states, "As a means of helping insure the maintenance of position changes, University System employers shall establish and implement a cyclic review program wherein position descriptions for all exempt positions are reviewed by the University System employer for currency of job content and title no less often than once every three years."

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

The Auditor requested the position description log related to Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) in order to determine compliance with triennial review standards. Upon review and check-in of the audit materials, it was determined that twenty-four (24) position descriptions listed in **Appendix B**, did not appear to be updated or reviewed for currency or content in accordance with established procedural guidelines.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

It appears that the Employer has not maintained adequate business processes to properly manage PAA position descriptions as procedurally required.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

Classification plan management protocols include base line standards for exemption authorization and evolve simply around one central concept, an evaluation of the position description. The cornerstone of proper position control management lies with the proper administration and maintenance of the position description. This is a fundamental necessity. Without this component in place, exemption authorization simply cannot be validated resulting in significant liability consequences.

Finding from Previous Audit:

No findings in this topic area were made during the last operational audit in FY2013.

Recommendation:

Consistent with the Exemption Procedures Manual, it is strongly recommended that the Employer immediately establish business procedures to properly maintain the position descriptions for these exempted positions. The Employer is asked to submit an updated position description log for Auditor review reflecting the status of current activity in this respect no later than <u>March 16, 2015</u>. As necessary, the Employer is requested to contact the incumbent and departmental representatives for the listed positions and request an updated/authenticated position description. Additionally, the Employer is also asked to review and implement business processes to insure that compliance with triennial review standards are applied in accordance with required guidelines.

It is recommended that the Employer emphasize the fundamental requirement of a periodic position development and review process for all Principal Administrative Appointments/Exemptions, in accordance with the Exemption Procedures Manual. Employees directly responsible for performing the position description review and authorization of Civil Service exemptions should be routinely informed and properly trained regarding classification plan management concepts, specifically those directly related to the exemption authorization process and corresponding procedural requirements.

<u>Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Joyce Coleman, Associate Vice President for</u> Human Resources and Diversity

Supervisors of the positions cited in Appendix B were recently contacted again to request updated job descriptions. (Some updated position description documents were provided to the Auditor.) As we receive the remaining requested job descriptions, we will forward them to the Auditor.

Four (4) employees have separated from GSU since the time of the audit (A1109 – Special Advisor to EVP, A1066 – Assistant VP, Marketing & Communications, A236 - External Programs Manager and A1030SNR - Academic Advisor Senior Status).

Going forward, HR will request an annual review of job descriptions when annual performance evaluations are completed to ensure that we are in compliance. (An annual performance evaluation form is attached for Auditor review.)

Governors State University <u>Final Audit Report</u>

<u>Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan and</u> Additional Auditor Comments

GSU FY15-03 Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) Illinois Administrative Code (Code), Section 250.70(f) Extra Help Appointments
- 2) Employment and Separation Procedures Manual, Section 2.5 Extra Help Appointments

Guidelines for Extra Help positions and Extra Help employees are contained in the Illinois Administrative Code. "An Extra Help appointment may be made by an employer to any position for work which the employer attests to be casual or emergent in nature and that meets the following conditions:

- A) the amount of time for which the services are needed is not usually predictable;
- B) payment for work performed is usually made on an hourly basis; and
- C) the work cannot readily be assigned, either on a straight-time or on an overtime basis, to a status employee."

"An Extra Help position may be utilized for a maximum of 900 hours of actual work in any consecutive 12 calendar months. The employer shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment that is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment. If an Extra Help position has accrued 900 consecutive hours, the position shall not be reestablished until six months have elapsed from the date of the termination of the position."

For Extra Help employees, the Code requires that "Upon working 900 hours, an Extra Help employee cannot resume employment in any Extra Help appointment at a place of employment until 30 calendar days have elapsed."

The employer's responsibility as noted in the Code is that they "... shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment that is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment." Understanding the need for continued temporary assistance, Extra Help extensions are allowed in specific instances in accordance with procedural guidelines.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

The Auditor reviewed two hundred forty-three (243) Extra Help appointments utilized during the audit time frame. As documented in **Appendix C**, twenty (20) employees were found to have worked beyond the 900-hour Extra Help limitation without the required 30-day break in service.

As further documented in **Appendix D**, it was also determined that fifteen (15) Extra Help positions were utilized for more than 900 hours of actual work within a 12 month period without a six month lapse. It appeared that several of the positions cited have several incumbents employed through them at the same time.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

During the previous FY2013 Biennial Compliance Audit, it appeared that proper protocols were in place to monitor this employment activity. However, based on current information provided by the Employer, it does not appear that these protocols were properly maintained, especially related to the 900-hour position utilization component. Additionally, based on the data analyzed, it does not appear that the required six month lapse, before a position can be reestablished, has been followed in several instances. This has resulted in the extended use of positions beyond the 900 hour limitation.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

Current Employer position management practices in this respect make it difficult to determine whether or not an Extra Help position, or employee, has exceeded employment limitations and should be terminated. Extra Help positions/people appear to be utilized longer than allowed, impacting the overall employment environment, which is inconsistent with the Code and Employment/Separation Procedures Manual.

Finding from Previous Audit:

During the FY2013 Biennial Compliance Audit, five (5) employees were found to have worked beyond the 900-hour Extra Help limitation without the required 30-day break in service. Additionally, it was determined that thirteen (13) Extra Help positions were utilized for more than 900 hours of actual work within a 12 month period without a six month lapse. It appeared that a few of the positions cited have several incumbents employed through them at the same time. [Finding Code GSU FY13-02, pages 9-11].

During the FY2011 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Auditor reviewed 285 Extra Help appointments utilized during the audit time frame. It was determined that three (3) employees were found to have worked beyond the 900-hour Extra Help limitation without the required 30-day break in service. [Finding Code NMGSU FY11-03, pages 5-7].

Recommendation:

We strongly recommend that the Employer conduct an internal review of their procedures to identify their deficiencies with respect to the Extra Help monitoring process and implement

stricter position management protocols that will adequately monitor and regulate Extra Help positions, and employees assigned to those positions, in accordance with Section 250.70(f) of the Code. Compliance with Extra Help appointment and position guidelines must be validated by adequately administering this employment activity, and strictly adhering to time frame limitations.

It should be noted that during the FY2013 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Employer indicated that their new payroll system has the ability to flag Human Resources when Extra Help appointments were approaching 700 hours. This process would provide Human Resources an opportunity to notify department supervisors in advance that employees and/or positions are reaching the maximum hours allowed. However, based on the data reviewed for the current audit, monitoring of Extra Help hours on a more consistent basis by the campus HR office is required in order to achieve compliance in this respect.

The Employer is reminded that while Extra Help appointments are intended to be utilized to assist during position vacancies, leaves of absence, and during peak work periods, position management protocols with respect to the 900 hour limitation must remain in place in accordance with established guidelines. The Auditor continues to emphasize that the practice of position pooling creates an additional layer of complexity and difficulty in administering these positions in accordance with regulatory standards.

The Auditor recommends that in order to reduce the frequency of these findings, the Employer may be able to utilize Extra Help Extensions, when applicable and consistent with the Employment Procedures Manual, and/or conduct an operational analysis to determine if there is need for the creation of additional status appointments in instances where there is a long term extensive use of these positions for similar job assignments.

<u>Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Joyce Coleman, Associate Vice President for</u> Human Resources and Diversity

A revised list of Extra Help Employees from Appendix C is attached for Auditor review.

HR sends supervisors a report of hours worked every 2-3 months to assist with monitoring the number of hours that Extra Help employees work and with monitoring the number of hours that Extra Help positions are utilized.

HR has requested an enhancement to our system that will allow HR to limit the number of hours each Extra Help employee works and that will alert HR and the hiring department supervisor when the Extra Help employee reaches the 700 hour mark.

As a follow-up to our previous audit in FY13, HR has discontinued the practice of assigning group position control numbers for Extra Help positions. HR continues to assign unique position control numbers for each position to monitor the number of hours of each Extra Help

position. The positions cited in Appendix D are a carryover from before we modified this practice. HR continues to work with our hiring departments to request Extra Help extensions when applicable.

Additional Auditor Comments:

The Auditor has reviewed the revised list of Extra Help Employees in Appendix C from the Employer, which indicates that four (4) employees were moved to status positions and that two (2) employees had approved extensions by the System Office. It should be noted that the four (4) employees became status appointments <u>after</u> exceeding the 900-hour limitation; and the two (2) employees with approved extensions and referenced in this finding exceeded the job end date requested and authorized by this office.

The Employment Procedures Manual, Section 2.5 states that "A review of Extra Help Appointments for compliance with the 900-hour limitation, any corresponding extension, and/or any other applicable criteria for such appointment shall be made at least every three months by the DER." Additional protocols initiated by the Employer and referenced in their Institutional Corrective Action Plan (ICAP) should adequately address issues related to this finding. The Employer is reminded that extensions of the 900 hour limitation will only be granted, under very limited circumstances, in instances demonstrating an unusual, rare, or critical need. Extensions due to workload peaks will generally not be granted unless it has a direct effect on the health and safety of students, patients, faculty/staff or the general public who are invited to sponsored events.

Governors State University Final Audit Report

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

GSU FY15-04 Civil Service Appointments – Position Descriptions Non-Compliant with

Cyclic Review Standards

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

1) Classification Procedures Manual, Section 2.2 Job Descriptions

Proper administration and communication of position descriptions is a fundamental element in any human resource program and the precursor to many 'best practice' human resource policies and procedures, particularly those related to classification plan management and performance evaluation. <u>Classification Procedures Manual, Section 2.2 Job Descriptions</u> requires that "All job descriptions shall be reviewed and updated at least every three years, including the signatures of the incumbent and supervisor." Our biennial audit process includes both a general review of all descriptions and a comprehensive review of a random sample of position descriptions.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

Consistent with materials requested for the current FY2015 Biennial Compliance Audit, the Auditor reviewed the Civil Service position description log submitted by the Employer. Out of approximately two-hundred fifty-nine (259) position description entries, it was determined eight (8) position description documents, listed in **Appendix E** did not appear to be updated or reviewed for currency or content in accordance with cyclic review guidelines.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

The Employer did not follow routine protocols in securing current and updated position descriptions assuring compliance with the triennial review standard.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

Incomplete or outdated position descriptions may cause misunderstandings between supervisors and employees related to performance expectations. Incomplete or outdated descriptions do not allow for the proper designation of work duties and can result in erroneous classification designations that unfavorably affect employee compensation and seniority benefits. Incomplete or outdated position descriptions may also compromise the integrity of the performance review and disciplinary process.

Finding from Previous Audit:

No findings in this topic area were made during the last operational audit in FY2013.

Recommendation:

The Employer is asked to submit an updated position description log for Auditor review reflecting the status of current activity in this respect no later than <u>March 16, 2015</u>. As necessary, the Employer is requested to contact the incumbent and departmental representatives for the listed positions and request an updated/authenticated position description. Additionally, the Employer is also asked to review and implement business processes to insure that cyclic position review standards are applied in accordance with required guidelines.

<u>Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Joyce Coleman, Associate Vice President for</u> Human Resources and Diversity

Supervisors of the positions cited in Appendix E were recently contacted again to request updated job descriptions. (Some updated position description documents were provided to the Auditor.) As we receive the remaining requested job descriptions, we will forward them to the Auditor.

Four (4) employees have separated from GSU since the time of the audit (C690 - Library Operations Associate, C846 - Office Manager, C1002 – Senior Library Specialist and C1109 – Administrative Assistant). Two (2) employees are deceased (C1101 – Steam & Power Plant III and C063 - Business/Administrative Associate). One (1) employee is on Disability (C874, Staff Clerk).

Going forward, HR will request an annual review of job descriptions when annual performance evaluations are completed to ensure that we are in compliance. (An annual performance evaluation form is attached for Auditor review.)

Appendix A

Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications

| Employee Name | Title | Current Hire Date | Job Begin Date | Annual Salary | Position Number | Recommended Civil Service Classification Options |
|---------------|--|----------------------|-------------------|------------------|--------------------|---|
| | Assistant Director | 9/4/2012 | 9/4/2012 | \$50,000.00 | A1042 | Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Business/Administrative Associate |
| | Digital Learning - Instructional Development Specialist/Coordinator | 7/1/2004 | 1/1/2006 | \$65,984.58 | A619 | Instructional Development Specialist |
| | Project Coordinator | 5/1/2008 | 5/1/2008 | \$56,226.54 | A006 | Public Information Series or Publicity/Promotion Specialist |
| | Assistant Director | 1/16/2014 | 3/1/2014 | \$50,000.00 | 1071 | Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Business/Administrative Associate |
| | Assistant to the Associate Vice President for Student Academic Support Services | 11/16/2004 | 9/16/2011 | \$46,575.00 | A957 | Office Support Series, Administrative Aide, or Administrative Assistant |
| | Assistant Director, Statewide Contract Administration | 3/17/2014 | 3/17/2014 | \$50,000.00 | A1060 | Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Business/Administrative Associate |
| | Ticket Sales Specialist | 7/12/2005 | 5/1/2013 | \$29,846.00 | A1097 | Publicity/Promotion Specialist |
| | Recruitment and Retention Coordinator | 6/25/2007 | 9/16/2013 | \$39,500.00 | A1075 | Program/Student Advisor |
| | Assistant Registrar | 11/1/2013 | 11/1/2013 | \$45,000.00 | A1091 | Office Support Series or Administrative Aide |
| | Marketing and Communications Manager | 1/22/2014 | 1/22/2014 | \$50,000.00 | A1015 | Public Information Series or Publicity/Promotion Specialist |
| | Coordinator for Veterans and Military Personnel | 10/16/2013 | 10/16/2013 | \$45,000.00 | A712 | Program/Student Advisor or Financial Aid Advisor |
| | Business Administrative Associate - Coordinator of Public Information | 6/1/2006 | 7/1/2012 | \$54,005.63 | A1032 | Public Information Series or Publicity/Promotion Specialist |
| | Administrative Assistant/Coordinator | 8/1/2001 | 8/1/2001 | \$41,807.70 | A440 | Office Support Series |
| | International Services Coordinator | 12/1/2012 | 12/1/2012 | \$40,000.00 | A1054 | Immigration Specialist or Program/Student Advisor |
| | Regional Training Manager/Coordinator | 2/1/2010 | 2/1/2010 | \$61,500.00 | A711 | Training and Development Specialist or Program Services Specialist |
| | Regional Training Manager/Special Project Manager | 8/16/2009 | 8/16/2009 | \$51,250.16 | A700 | Training and Development Specialist or Program Services Specialist |
| | Assistant to Vice President | 4/25/2012 | 9/16/2013 | \$45,000.00 | A1098 | Office Support Series |
| | Television Production and Digital Media Specialist | 8/1/1996 | 7/1/2012 | \$55,552.59 | A1004 | Television Director-Producer |
| | Alternative Certification Recruitment Coordinator and Student Advisor | 10/1/2008 | 9/1/2011 | \$25,461.25 | A675 | Program/Student Advisor |
| | Assistant to the Vice President for Administration and Finance | 9/1/2010 | 8/16/2012 | \$40,000.00 | A998 | Office Support Series, Administrative Aide, or Administrative Assistant |
| | Senior Social Worker/Coordinator | 8/1/2002 | 8/1/2002 | \$32,728.33 | A472 | Program Services Specialist |
| | Assistant Controller | 11/16/2012 | 11/1/2013 | \$72,000.00 | A938X | Comptroller Series or Business/Administrative Associate |
| | Assistant to the Dean | 10/17/1995 | 7/1/2006 | \$55,790.66 | A585 | Administrative Assistant or Business/Administrative Associate |

Appendix A

Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications

| Employee Name | Title | Current Hire Date | Job Begin Date | Annual Salary | Position Number | Recommended Civil Service Classification Options |
|---------------|--|----------------------|-------------------|------------------|--------------------|---|
| | Regional Training Manager/Coordinator | 5/1/2007 | 11/1/2008 | \$47,150.08 | A624 | Training and Development Specialist or Program Services Specialist |
| | Recruiting Specialist | 4/22/2013 | 3/16/2014 | \$35,000.00 | A1111 | Admissions and Records Series or Program/Student Advisor |
| | Executive Assistant to the President | 10/24/2005 | 10/24/2005 | \$71,918.01 | A634 | Executive Secretary or Administrative Assistant |
| | Assistant To | 10/1/2005 | 10/1/2005 | \$41,174.25 | A570 | Program Coordinator Series |
| | DDP Program Coordinator of Peer Mentoring | 4/1/2012 | 7/1/2012 | \$46,575.00 | A1022 | Program Coordinator Series |
| | Assistant to the Deputy Director/Staff Assistant | 6/1/2004 | 2/1/2013 | \$47,508.75 | A604X | Office Support Series |
| | Admissions and Recruiting Specialist | 10/22/2012 | 10/22/2012 | \$40,000.00 | A1033 | Admissions and Records Series or Program/Student Advisor |
| | Coordinator, Student Accounts | 9/1/1989 | 11/16/2006 | \$61,989.64 | A589 | Account Technician Series |
| | Special Projects Manager | 3/16/2002 | 1/16/2008 | \$62,525.08 | A643 | Office Support Series |
| _ | Manager of Enrollment and External Programs | 6/1/2012 | 6/1/2012 | \$65,205.00 | A975 | Program Coordinator Series |
| | Admissions and Recruiting Specialist | 2/16/2014 | 2/16/2014 | \$40,000.00 | A1034 | Admissions and Records Series or Program/Student Advisor |

Appendix B

Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Non-Compliant With Triennial Review Standards

| Position Control Number | Current PAA Classification Title | Date of Last Review |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------|
| A545 | Director of Field Experience | 8/22/2008 |
| A1058 | Senior Cultural Market Specialist | |
| A620 | Academic Advisor | |
| A262 | Director | 3/7/2008 |
| A1043 | Director | 5/27/2008 |
| A400 | Academic Advisor | |
| A030XSNR | Assistant Director Senior Status | 6/25/2003 |
| A647I | Assistant to | 4/28/2008 |
| A1056 | Director of Development | |
| A443X | Special Project Manager | 2/19/2008 |
| A503 | Coordinator | 3/11/2008 |
| A562SNR | Academic Advisor Senior Status | |
| F403 | Outreach Counselor | |
| A374X | Specialist | 6/27/2003 |
| A403 | Academic Advisor | |
| A966 | Coordinator | 9/1/2001 |
| A1018X | Academic Advisor | |
| A964 | Director, Governmental And Comm | |
| A430 | Multimedia Instructional Technician | 5/8/2008 |
| A1006 | Specialist, Online Instruction | |
| A1029 | Academic Advisor | |
| A1055SNR | Instructional Developer | |
| A027 | Director | 5/8/2003 |
| A409 | Specialist | 7/12/2000 |

Appendix C

Extra Help Employees Exceeding 900-Hour Rule

| Employee Name | Position Classification | Department | Beginning Appointment Date | Ending Appointment Date | Employee Hours Worked |
|---------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|
| | Extra Help Maintenance Laborer | Facilities Development & Mgmt | 10/1/2012 | 11/17/2013 | 866.25 |
| " | Extra Help Maintenance Laborer | Facilities Development & Mgmt | 11/18/2013 | 5/6/2014 | 731.50 |
| | | | | | 1597.75 |
| | | | | | |
| | Civil Service Extra Help | Department of Public Safety | 4/1/2012 | 9/30/2012 | 378.00 |
| п | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 10/16/2012 | 12/15/2013 | 930.00 |
| | | | | | 1308.00 |
| | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 5/31/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1489.50 |
| | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 1/29/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1277.00 |
| п | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 1/1/2014 | 3/31/2014 | 392.00 |
| | | | | | 1669.00 |
| | Extra Help Receptionist Nurse | Nursing | 2/7/2012 | 9/30/2012 | 800.25 |
| " | Extra Help Data Coordinator | Nursing | 10/16/2012 | 10/30/2013 | 640.00 |
| | | | | | 1440.25 |
| | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 11/30/2012 | 9/30/2013 | 1221.50 |
| | Extra Help Professional Coord. | Centerpoint | 4/23/2012 | 1/15/2013 | 1165.75 |
| | Extra Help Substitute Cook | Family Development Center | 10/15/2012 | 12/31/2012 | 925.25 |
| | Public Safety/Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 1/15/2013 | 1/15/2014 | 1184.75 |
| | Bar Manager | Center for Performing Arts | 3/5/2012 | 1/29/2013 | 798.45 |
| " | Extra Help Bar & Concessions M | Center for Performing Arts | 1/31/2013 | 9/30/2013 | 950.50 |
| | | | | | 1,748.95 |
| | Extra Help Receptionist | Admissions | 2/24/2014 | 5/12/2014 | 1,835.00 |

Appendix C

Extra Help Employees Exceeding 900-Hour Rule

| Employee Name | Position Classification | Department | Beginning Appointment Date | Ending Appointment Date | Employee Hours Worked |
|---------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| | Extra Help Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 9/1/2012 | 9/15/2013 | 926.75 |
| п | Extra Help Sub Asst Teacher | Family Development Center | 10/8/2013 | | 471.50 |
| | | | | | 1,398.25 |
| | Extra Help Professional | Student Life | 1/2/2013 | 10/31/2013 | 1,253.50 |
| | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 3/13/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1,135.00 |
| | Civil Service Extra Help | Department of Public Safety | 10/31/2012 | 3/31/2013 | 896.50 |
| " | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 4/1/2013 | | 1,469.75 2,366.25 |
| | | | | | 2,5555 |
| | Extra Help Stagehand | Center for Performing Arts | 5/17/2013 | 3/31/2014 | 1,226.50 |
| | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 3/14/2012 | 10/15/2012 | 1,140.50 |
| | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 4/15/2013 | 3/31/2014 | 1,373.00 |
| | Extra Help Maint. Laborer | Facilities Development & Mgmt | 1/9/2012 | 11/15/2012 | 1,042.25 |
| | Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 9/5/2012 | 10/15/2013 | 1,011.00 |

Appendix D

Extra Help Positions Exceeding 900-Hour Rule

| Position Number | Employee Name | Position Classification | Department | Beginning Appointment Date | Ending Appointment Date | Employee Hours Worked |
|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------------------|--|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Т0707 | Multiple Incumbents | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 7/18/2011 | 1/1/2013 | 600.25 |
| " | п | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 7/25/2011 | 7/31/2012 | 236.00 |
| " | п | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 9/12/2011 | 8/31/2012 | 32.50 |
| " | п | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 4/1/2012 | 10/31/2012 | 489.50 |
| " | п | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 4/15/2012 | 5/31/2012 | 313.00 |
| | " | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 4/15/2012 | 7/31/2012 | 480.00 |
| " | п | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 4/15/2012 | 7/31/2012 | 362.50 |
| " | п | Extra Help- Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 6/30/2012 | 5/15/2013 | 684.00 |
| " | n . | Extra Help - Public Safety | Department of Public Safety | 8/31/2012 | 3/15/2013 | 897.00 |
| | | | | | | 4094.75 |
| T10352010PA#1 | | Public Safety/Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 4/15/2012 | 12/15/2012 | 839.00 |
| " " | " | Public Safety/Protective Aide | | 1/15/2013 | | 1184.75 |
| | ıı . | Public Safety/Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety Department of Public Safety | 2/15/2014 | 1/15/2014 3/31/2014 | 184.00 |
| | | Public Salety/Protective Alde | Department of Public Safety | 2/15/2014 | 3/31/2014 | 2207.75 |
| | | | | | | |
| T10352010PA#3 | | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 3/13/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1135.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 1/15/2014 | 3/31/2014 | 356.00 |
| | | | | | | 1491.00 |
| T10352010PA#7 | | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 11/30/2012 | 9/30/2013 | 891.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help Protective Aide | Department of Public Safety | 10/31/2013 | 3/31/2014 | 515.50 |
| | | | | | | 1406.50 |
| T10352010T#1 | | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 5/31/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1489.50 |
| " | п | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 1/15/2014 | 3/31/2014 | 47.50 |
| | | Extra resp reseasing metals | Department of Fabric Sarety | 1/15/2011 | 3/31/2011 | 1537.00 |
| | | | | | | |
| T10352010T#3 | | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 1/29/2013 | 12/15/2013 | 1277.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help Telecommunicator | Department of Public Safety | 1/1/2014 | 3/31/2014 | 392.00 |
| | | | | | | 1669.00 |
| T1755 | | Civil Service Extra Help | Department of Public Safety | 4/1/2012 | 9/30/2012 | 378.00 |
| " | | Civil Service Extra Help | Department of Public Safety | 10/31/2012 | 3/31/2013 | 896.50 |
| | | · | | | | 1274.50 |
| | | | | | | |

Appendix D

Extra Help Positions Exceeding 900-Hour Rule

| Position Number | Employee Name | Position Classification | Department | Beginning Appointment Date | Ending Appointment Date | Employee Hours Worked |
|-----------------|---------------------|--|--|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|
| T1820 | Multiple Incumbents | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 12/4/2007 | 8/12/2012 | 11.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 10/1/2008 | 8/12/2012 | 97.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 11/20/2008 | 8/12/2012 | 55.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 3/13/2009 | 8/12/2012 | 16.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 9/9/2009 | 8/21/2012 | 373.75 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 2/16/2011 | 8/12/2012 | 43.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 12/1/2011 | 8/11/2012 | 312.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help | Center for Performing Arts | 9/13/2012 | 4/15/2013 | 843.00 |
| | | | | | | 1752.75 |
| T200020 | Multiple Incumbents | Extra Help-sub Teach | Family Development Center | 10/14/2011 | 1/1/2013 | 760.50 |
| " | " | • | 1 | 10/21/2011 | 10/12/2012 | 433.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help-sub Teach Extra Help-sub Teach | Family Development Center Family Development Center | 12/16/2011 | 8/31/2012 | 310.00 |
| | | extra neip-sub reacri | Family Development Center | 12/16/2011 | 6/31/2012 | |
| | | | | | | 1504.00 |
| T200020ST | | Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 3/6/2012 | 6/30/2012 | 340.25 |
| " | | Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 9/5/2012 | 10/15/2013 | 1011.00 |
| | | | | | | 1351.25 |
| | | | | 2/1/2212 | - / / | |
| T200020ST#10 | | Extra Help Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 9/1/2012 | 9/15/2013 | 926.75 |
| | | Extra Help Substitute Teacher | Family Development Center | 10/15/2012 | 4/30/2014 | 170.00 |
| | | | | | | 1096.75 |
| T250030RA | | Extra Help Records Assistant | Student Life | 1/30/2012 | 7/15/2012 | 548.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help Records Assistant | Student Life | 9/1/2012 | 12/31/2012 | 576.00 |
| | | | | | | 1124.50 |
| | | | | | | |
| T251030PA1 | | Extra Help Professional Aide | Student Life | 8/31/2012 | 3/31/2013 | 834.00 |
| " | " | Extra Help Professional Aide | Student Life | 4/30/2013 | 5/31/2013 | 195.00 |
| | | | | | | 1029.00 |
| T301500 | | Extra Help Professional | Financial Srvcs & Comptroller | 4/18/2012 | 2/28/2013 | 1,426.25 |
| " | " | Extra Help Professional | Financial Srvcs & Comptroller | 6/2/2013 | 11/15/2013 | 820.00 |
| | | | | | | 2,246.25 |
| | | | | 0/4/22:2 | 0.427 | 702-2 |
| T401000MPCC1 | Multiple Incumbents | Extra Help Mail & Prop C. C. | Procurement & Business Service | 9/4/2012 | 3/17/2013 | 700.50 |
| " | " | Extra Help Mail & Prop C. C. Extra Help Mail & Prop C. C. | Procurement & Business Service Procurement & Business Service | 12/17/2012 | 4/30/2014 12/31/2013 | 15.00 511.25 |
| | | Extra melp Ividii & Prop C. C. | Frocurement & Business Service | 1///2015 | 12/31/2013 | 1,226.75 |

Appendix E

Civil Service Position Descriptions Non-Compliant With Cyclic Review Standards

| Position Control Number | Classification Title | Date of Last Review |
|----------------------------|--|------------------------|
| C1100 | Steam & Power Plant III | |
| C112 | Library Specialist | |
| C875 | Program Administrative Assistant | 10/31/2008 |
| C798 | Senior Library Specialist | 11/17/2008 |
| C656 | Payroll Specialist III | 1/11/2007 |
| C847 | Office Manager | 4/15/2008 |
| C855 | Office Manager | 2/6/2008 |
| C946 | Training and Development Specialist II | |