

# STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center  
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24  
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



*Joanne E. Maitland  
Merit Board Chair  
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director*

May 31, 2012

**FILE COPY**

Dr. Glenn Poshard  
President  
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Dr. Duane Stucky  
Senior Vice President for Financial and Administrative Services and Board Treasurer  
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Mr. Kevin Bame  
Vice Chancellor for Administration and Finance  
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Ms. Jennifer Watson  
Director of Human Resources  
Designated Employer Representative  
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Ms. Kimberly Labonte  
Executive Director of Audits  
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland  
Merit Board Chair  
State Universities Civil Service System

Dr. Donna Manering  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at the Southern Illinois University Carbondale. The audit period tested was October 1, 2009 through September 30, 2011. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Southern Illinois University Carbondale and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director

---

---

# Southern Illinois University Carbondale Final Audit Report

---



## State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

May 31, 2012

Audit Period

October 1, 2009 to September 30, 2011

---

Prepared by:

---

Lucinda M. Neitzel  
Audit and Advisory Services Manager

**Southern Illinois University Carbondale**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Table of Contents**

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <b>Introduction .....</b>  | <b>1</b> |
| <b>Executive Summary .....</b>   | <b>3</b> |
| <b>Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional Auditor Comments .....</b> | <b>4</b> |

**Appendices**

Appendix A: Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications

## **Southern University of Illinois Carbondale**

### **Final Audit Report**

### **Introduction**

#### **PURPOSE**

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) ([110 ILCS 70/36b\(3\)](#)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#))] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” ([80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140\(c\)](#)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted January 23-26, 2012. Upon submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and a Supplemental Report (Non-material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office for internal use.

#### **OVERVIEW**

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**

The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.

- **Compensation Programs**

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer’s use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer’s

compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Positions Exempt from Civil Service Guidelines**

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

[Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager](#)  
[Jeff Brownfield, Manager of Operations Division](#)  
[Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant](#)

**Southern Illinois University Carbondale**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Executive Summary**  
**YEAR ENDED FY2012**

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act ([110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.](#)), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#)), [State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals](#), applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

**SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Number of</u></b>                | <b><u>This Report</u></b> |
|--|---------------------------|
| Findings                               | 1                         |
| Repeated findings from previous audit® | 1®                        |

**SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Item Number</u></b> | <b><u>Page</u></b> | <b><u>Description</u></b>   |
|---------------------------|--------------------|---|
| SIUC FY12-01              | 4                  | FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT)<br>Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications® |

**Southern Illinois University Carbondale**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations and Institutional Corrective Action Plan**

**SIUC FY12-01      Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications**

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 70/36e Coverage](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)
- 4) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1 Principal Administrative Appointments](#)
- 5) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review](#)
- 6) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3), the Employer may

be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

Through a review of approximately one-hundred (100) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that forty (40) exempted positions listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. The cited positions simply do not contain the duties or level of authority and responsibility that would typically fall outside the specifications of standard professional or technical Civil Service classifications.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

According to the Employer's payroll records, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

**Finding from Previous Audit:**

During the FY2010 compliance audit, through a review of approximately eighty (80) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that eleven (11) exempt positions were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. Additionally, during the FY2008 compliance audit, the Auditor identified ten (10) positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classifications. *[Finding Code SIUC FY10-01, pages 4-7 and Finding Code SIUC FY08-01, pages 4-5].*

**Recommendation:**

The Illinois Administrative Code, Section 250.30(a) specifically provides that the Merit Board has the authority to determine Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA) at each institution or agency. Specifically, it states that "The Director shall publish guidelines for such exemptions, as approved by the Merit Board."

We refer the Employer to these guidelines located in the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1, Principal Administrative Appointments](#), approved by the Merit Board in June 2009. By definition, a PAA is "...an employee who is charged with high level administrative responsibilities, whose decisions are based on administrative policies, and who exercises discretion and independent judgment. In addition, a PAA can be defined as an employee who is



in a position requiring knowledge of an advanced type in a field of science or learning customarily acquired by a prolonged course of specialized intellectual instruction and study...and which requires the consistent exercise of discretion and judgment, e.g., physician, attorney, engineer, architect.”

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in these standards, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles. Improper exemptions from Civil Service regulations can lead to a fundamental breakdown of several interrelated human resource functions; including employment status, position classification, seniority, recruitment, compensation, performance, and benefit administration.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. *Specifically, positions determined to be inappropriately exempted and flagged through the compliance audit process must be reviewed as a matter of standard protocol at the next contract renewal date.* If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible. It is strongly recommended that positions designated to be transitioned to Civil Service appointments be moved as soon as possible, preferably at the next employment contract renewal date, but certainly no later than at such time that these positions become vacant again. We refer the Employer to the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#) for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil Service Appointments. Please note that positions designated for transition through the audit process will be reviewed in the next biennial audit process and must be monitored by the Employer periodically.

The Employer may also utilize the Pilot Program classification designations and transition the positions to be reviewed into one of these classifications if appropriate. These [Pilot Program](#) classifications utilize more flexible employment protocols and would offer a more transparent transition.

#### **Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Jennifer Watson, Director of Human Resources**

The employer agrees with the recommendation and agrees to complete a review of the position descriptions identified in Appendix A to determine proper exemption status. If positions are found to be improperly exempted, the employer will transition the position to civil service as soon as possible. Previously exempted positions will continue to be monitored by the employer as updated positions are submitted for review and approval. In addition, we will explore the possibility of creating a procedure that would facilitate the review of vacant positions for exemption status prior to advertisement and hire.

**State Universities Civil Service System  
Southern Illinois University at Carbondale  
FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

| Employee Name                  | Title  | Monthly Salary | Position Number | Recommended Civil Service Classification  |
|--------------------------------|--|----------------|-----------------|---|
| Baer, Robert A.                | Computer/Electronics Specialist  | \$5,469.00     | C.AP.454.000    | Information Technology Management Series or Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| Bennett, Shane M.              | Assistant Director, Recreational Sports & Services (Intramural Sports/Clubs)   | \$3,795.67     | C.AP.884.000    | Intramural and Recreation Coordinator or Manager of Sports Facilities   |
| Bouhl, Crystal K.              | Assistant Director - Marketing   | \$3,969.00     | C.AP.1144.001   | Housing Administration Series   |
| Bouhl, Greg                    | Assistant Director, Entrepreneurship & Business Development                    | \$4,583.33     | C.AP.1653.000   | Grants and Contracts Administrator Series or Business/Administrative Associate  |
| Brown, Leslie A.               | Textual Editor   | \$3,199.00     | C.AP.1575.000   | Publications Series or Editorial Series   |
| Bryson, Todd                   | Assistant Director, Recreational Sports & Services (Facilities and Operations) | \$4,097.00     | C.AP.763.002    | Intramural and Recreation Coordinator or Manager of Sports Facilities   |
| Bullard, Letitia L.            | Computer Information Specialist, Computer Learning Center 1                    | \$4,423.00     | C.AP.554.000    | Microcomputer Support Specialist Series or Information Technology Support Associate   |
| Craig, Robert H.               | Computer Information Specialist  | \$4,158.00     | C.AP.1221.001   | Local Area Network (LAN) Support Series, Information Technology Technical Associate or Information Technology Support Associate                   |
| Crews, Kendra V.               | Web Portal Site Content Specialist   | \$4,025.00     | C.AP.1881.000   | Web Specialist Series or Information Technology Support Associate   |
| Cubley, Michael A.             | Assistant Director for Research  | \$4,416.00     | C.AP.640.003    | Information Technology Management Series or Information Technology Technical Associate  |
| Devenport, Vickie              | Field Representative (Educational Outreach)                                    | \$3,156.00     | C.AP.938.000    | Public Information Series   |
| Dunn, John P.                  | Instructional Support Specialist   | \$4,532.00     | C.AP.667.002    | Instructional Media Systems Series  |
| Etcheson, Amy J.               | Coordinator of Marketing and Promotions  | \$4,901.00     | C.AP.239.001    | Publicity-Promotions Specialist or Public Information Series  |
| Gill, Lynn T.                  | Coordinator for Wellness Programming (Nutrition & Fitness)                     | \$4,197.25     | C.AP.449.000    | Health Education Coordinator  |
| Hale, Casey A.                 | Annual Fund Director, Athletics  | \$3,451.00     | C.AP.1509.000   | Development Officer   |
| Herman, Matthew E.             | Assistant Director for Student Information Systems                             | \$5,030.00     | C.AP.1228.001   | Information Technology Management Series or Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator   |
| Hood, Chester                  | Admissions Coordinator   | \$2,584.00     | C.AP.627.000    | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser  |
| Hostetler, Sandra J.           | Computer Information Specialist  | \$4,432.00     | C.AP.355.000    | Information Technology Management Series, Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator or Information Technology Technical Associate |
| Johnson-Westra, Lynne A.       | Digital Media Systems Specialist   | \$3,911.00     | C.AP.1522.001   | Web Specialist Series, Information Technology Technical Associate or Information Technology Support Associate                                     |
| Julian-Fralish, Christopher J. | Coordinator for Wellness Programming (Alcohol and Drug Education)              | \$4,051.00     | C.AP.1139.000   | Health Education Coordinator  |
| Kimball, Rebecca L.            | Coordinator (Fitness), Recreational Sports & Services                          | \$3,375.00     | C.AP.1864.000   | Intramural and Recreation Coordinator   |

**State Universities Civil Service System  
Southern Illinois University at Carbondale  
FY2012 Biennial Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

| Employee Name            | Title  | Monthly Salary | Position Number | Recommended Civil Service Classification                                 |
|--------------------------|--|----------------|-----------------|--|
| Kinkelaar, Amber L.      | Assistant Director for Institutional Advancement and Annual Giving | \$2,791.00     | C.AP.811.000    | Development Officer  |
| Kirsch, Ora E.           | Field Representative   | \$3,587.00     | C.AP416.000     | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Marlo, Timothy M.        | Assistant Director of Business and Financial Services/Controller   | \$5,051.34     | C.AP.726.000    | Comptroller Series   |
| Morgan, Tanna J.         | Associate Director for Institutional Advancement (Science)         | \$5,491.00     | C.AP.1478.001   | Development Officer  |
| Morrisette-Zapp, Lisa J. | Operations Manager, WSIU Radio                                     | \$3,928.00     | C.AP.615.000    | Chief Broadcasting Engineer  |
| Phoenix, Darla G.        | Education Coordinator  | \$2,780.00     | C.AP.650.000    | Administrative Aide  |
| Reis, Michael R.         | Coordinator of External Operations                                 | \$2,804.00     | C.AP.135.000    | Sports Information Director or Public Information Series                 |
| Rhomberg, Vincent P.     | Coordinator of Marketing & Public Information                      | \$3,019.00     | C.AP.1644.000   | Publicity-Promotions Specialist  |
| Roper, Markida J.        | Field Contact Specialist   | \$2,745.00     | C.AP.1848.000   | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Sapienza, Zachary A.     | Assistant Director, Alumni Services                                | \$3,416.67     | C.AP.955.000    | Assistant Director of Alumni Relations                                   |
| Smith, Steven R.         | Assistant Director - Contracts                                     | \$4,299.00     | C.AP.1597.001   | Housing Administration Series  |
| Stenhaus, Rebecca L.     | Associate Director for Institutional Advancement (Central)         | \$4,714.67     | C.AP.1619.000   | Development Officer  |
| Sutton, Amanda J.        | Admissions Coordinator   | \$3,033.01     | C.AP. 1181.000  | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Taitt, Matthew R.        | Admissions Coordinator   | \$2,613.00     | C.AP.564.000    | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Taylor, Kenya D.         | Admissions Coordinator   | \$3,167.00     | C.AP. 347.000   | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Thompson, Kara B.        | Coordinator for Recruitment  | \$3,370.00     | C.AP.1092.001   | Admissions and Records Series or Program Adviser                         |
| Wallace, Mary J.         | Assistant Director for Records Management                          | \$4,250.00     | C.AP.1883.000   | Records Management Officer or Information Technology Technical Associate |
| Weber, Thomas R.         | Director of Media Services   | \$4,577.00     | C.AP.649.001    | Sports Information Director or Public Information Series                 |
| Williams, Derrick L.     | Coordinator for Wellness Programming (Violence Prevention)         | \$4,051.00     | C.AP.151.000    | Health Education Coordinator   |