

STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



*Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director*

September 29, 2010

Dr. Alvin Goldfarb
President
Western Illinois University

Ms. Rita Moore
Director, Internal Auditing
Western Illinois University

Ms. Jacqueline K. Thompson
Vice President/Administrative Services
Western Illinois University

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
State Universities Civil Service System

Ms. Pamela Bowman
Human Resource Director
Designated Employer Representative
Western Illinois University

Mr. Donald "Bill" Griffin
Merit Board Member
State Universities Civil Service System

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at Western Illinois University. The audit period tested was November 1, 2007 through October 31, 2009. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Western Illinois University and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director

Western Illinois University Final Audit Report



State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

September 29, 2010

Audit Period

November 1, 2007 to October 31, 2009

Prepared by:

Lucinda M. Neitzel

Audit and Advisory Services Manager

Western Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Executive Summary.....	4
Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional Auditor Comments	5

Appendices

Appendix A: Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Appendix B: Extra Help Positions Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Western Illinois University *Final Audit Report*

Introduction

PURPOSE

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) ([110 ILCS 70/36b\(3\)](#)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#))] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” ([80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140\(c\)](#)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted February 16-19, 2010. An Exit conference was conducted on August 2, 2010 and provided an opportunity for the Employer to discuss both the Material and Non-material findings contained in the initial Draft Audit Report. Upon completion of the exit conference and submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and a Supplemental Report (Non-material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office for internal use.

OVERVIEW

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**

The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.

- **Compensation Programs**

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer's use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer's compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA)**

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

[Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager](#)

[Jeff Brownfield, Manager of Operations Division](#)

[Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant](#)

Western Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Executive Summary
YEAR ENDED -- FY2010

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act ([110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.](#)), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#)), [State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals](#), applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Number of</u>	<u>This Report</u>
Findings	2
Repeated findings from previous audit®	2®

SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Description</u>
WIU FY10-01	5	FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications
WIU FY10-02	9	FINDINGS (ILLINOIS ADMINISTRATIVE CODE) Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations

Western Illinois University
Final Audit Report

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plan, and
Additional Auditor Comments**

WIU FY10-01 Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 36\(e\)](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)
- 4) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review](#)
- 5) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3), the Employer may

be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

Through a review of approximately fifty (50) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that six (6) exempted positions listed below were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. These positions are listed below, with the corresponding Civil Service classification match.

Employee	PAA Title	Civil Service Classification Match
Monica Eskridge	Admissions Counselor	Program Adviser
Amanda Shoemaker	Associate Director, Alumni Services	Assistant Director of Alumni Relations
Renee Simpson	Assistant to the Director of Human Resources	Human Resource Series, Human Resource Associate, or Equal Opportunity Officer Series
Michael Taylor	Director of University Television	Television Program Director
Jeremy Merritt	Instructional Technology Systems Manager	Information Technology Management Series, Information Technology Technical Associate, or Web Specialist Series
Nicholas Knowles	Coordinator for Campus Recreation	Manager of Sports Facilities

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

According to the Employer, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

Finding from Previous Audit:

The Auditor identified four exempted positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classification(s) in the FY2008 compliance audit. *[Finding Code WIU FY08-01, pages 4-5].*

Recommendation:

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in [Section 36\(e\)](#) of the Act and other related procedures, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible, but no later than at such time that these positions become vacant. It is strongly recommended that these positions be moved immediately, or at the next employment contract renewal date if applicable. We refer the Employer to the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#) for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate Civil service Appointments.

The Employer may also utilize the Pilot Program classification designations and transition the positions to be reviewed to one of these classifications if appropriate. These [Pilot Program](#) classifications utilize more flexible employment protocols and would offer a more transparent transition.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Pamela Bowman, Director of Human Resources

SUCSS protocols, rules and procedures in the establishment of these positions have been followed. Standard titles are used and where necessary, SUCSS approval was sought and provided to the University.

The suggested civil service classifications do not appear to encompass the scope or capacity in which the identified positions function. However, we will review these classifications as suggested. If the University finds that these positions meet the specifications of the civil service classifications as suggested, the University will transition these positions upon vacancy.

Additional Auditor Comments:

Please be reminded that the primary mechanism that defines whether a position meets the criteria for exemption, or meets the specifications of a civil service recommendation, is through a review of the position description. If it is determined through those review protocols that a particular position description matches Civil Service specifications, then the appropriate Civil

Service classification is assigned. The classification plan is changing constantly, so what may have been exempt yesterday may not be exempt today, especially with the use of new classification broad-banding concepts. Please note also that an Employer's failure or unwillingness to utilize a specific classification does not insulate them from findings in this regard. Those positions listed will be flagged and will be included in the Auditor's review during the next audit period.

Please note also that those positions cited were not approved for exemption by the System Office and, fundamentally, through a review of the position description match civil service classification specifications.

Western Illinois University
Final Audit Report

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

WIU FY10-02 Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.70\(f\) Extra Help Appointments](#)
- 2) [Employment and Separation Procedures Manual, Section 2.5 Extra Help Appointments](#)

Guidelines for Extra Help positions and Extra Help employees are contained in the Illinois Administrative Code. "An Extra Help appointment may be made by an employer to any position for work which the employer attests to be casual or emergent in nature and that meets the following conditions:

- A) the amount of time for which the services are needed is not usually predictable;
- B) payment for work performed is usually made on an hourly basis; and
- C) the work cannot readily be assigned, either on a straight-time or on an overtime basis, to a status employee."

"An Extra Help position may be utilized for a maximum of 900 hours of actual work in any consecutive 12 calendar months. The employer shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment that is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment. If an Extra Help position has accrued 900 consecutive hours, the position shall not be reestablished until six months have elapsed from the date of the termination of the position."

For Extra Help employees, the Code requires that "Upon working 900 hours, an Extra Help employee cannot resume employment in any Extra Help appointment at a place of employment until 30 calendar days have elapsed."

The employer's responsibility as noted in the Code is that they "... shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment that is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment." Understanding the need for continued temporary assistance, Extra Help extensions are allowed in specific instances in accordance with procedural guidelines.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

As documented in **Appendix A**, two (2) employees were found to have worked beyond the 900-hour Extra Help limitation without the required 30-day break in service.

As further documented in **Appendix B**, it was also determined that fifteen (15) Extra Help positions were utilized for more than 900 hours of actual work within a 12 month period without a six month lapse. A few of the positions cited had several incumbents employed through them at the same time.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

Based on the information provided by the Employer, it does not appear that adequate protocols to efficiently and effectively monitor Extra Help limitations were established or maintained, especially related to the 900-hour position utilization component. While on-site, the Employer indicated that Extra Help appointments are tracked by budget line instead of through position numbers, which are not used in their payroll system to properly identify specific jobs within a department. Based on the data analyzed, it does not appear that the required six month lapse before a position can be reestablished has been followed in some instances, resulting in the extended use of positions beyond the 900 hour limitation.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

Current Employer position management practices in this respect make it difficult to determine whether or not an Extra Help position, or employee, has exceeded employment limitations and should be terminated. Extra Help positions/people appear to be utilized longer than allowed, impacting the overall employment environment, which is inconsistent with the Code and Employment/Separation Procedures Manual.

Finding from Previous Audit:

The Auditor identified various appointments and positions determined to have been utilized beyond the 900 hour limitations without the appropriate breaks in both the FY2008 and FY2006 compliance audits. *[Finding Code WIU FY08-02, pages 6-7 and FY2006, page 16].*

Recommendation:

This topic was discussed with the Employer following the on-site portion of the audit and follow-up information was provided to assist with distinguishing some of the positions where there had been initial concern. The Employer should be aware that while Extra Help appointments are intended to be utilized to assist during position vacancies, leaves of absence, and during peak work periods, position management protocols with respect to the 900 hour limitation must remain in place in accordance with established guidelines.

We recommend that the Employer identify and implement additional position management protocols that will adequately monitor and regulate Extra Help positions, and employees assigned to those positions, in accordance with Section 250.70(f) of the Code.

Additionally, to reduce the frequency of these findings, the Employer may be able to further utilize [Extra Help Extensions](#), when applicable, and/or conduct an operational analysis to determine if there is need for the creation of additional status appointments in instances where there is a long term extensive use of these positions for similar job assignments.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Pamela Bowman, Director of Human Resources

Typically the University uses Extra Help to assist a department when a status employee is on medical leave, military leave and/or to assist the department in meeting its operational needs. At times, the status employee is unable to return to work within the 900 hours.

As noted in the previous SUCSS audit, the University will continue to review internal procedures for managing Extra Help appointments, taking operational needs into consideration.

Additionally, the University will continue to explore the feasibility of requesting extensions for certain Extra Help positions which appear to meet the standards recently established by SUCSS. In the past, Extra Help extensions have not been a viable option and when the University has requested an extension, SUCSS has denied the request. Given our current budgetary restraints, it would create a negative environment in which to compel departments to either hire status employees or perform without needed assistance.

F. Hedblade and Alice Moss exceeded the 900 hour rule due to a computer program error that dropped the previous fiscal year data from a report. Therefore, we did not catch the hours worked without a 30-day break in the previous fiscal year (June 2-30, 2008 for Hedblade and May 5-June 30, 2008 for Moss).

Additional Auditor Comments:

System Rules and procedures effectively establish guidelines for extra help appointments and allow extensions in those appointments under specific conditions. Extensions are permitted to replace status employees who are on extended medical leave or military leave. However, extensions are not afforded beyond the normal 900 hour, or roughly six month continuous employment period, simply to meet operational demand. Simple operational demand beyond such a timeframe is typically an indication of a long-term employment need or full time employment necessity. Some of the positions cited were actually at a full-time hourly equivalent well beyond a six month period of time, indicating a possible full-time employment situation.

State Universities Civil Service System
Western Illinois University
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix A

Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee Name	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Hedblade, Frances G.	Registrar	6/2/08	6/30/08	89.00
	"	7/1/08	7/13/08	37.00
	"	7/14/08	12/23/08	539.50
	"	1/5/09	4/9/09	278.50
				944.00
Moss, Alice L.	Beu Health Center	5/5/08	6/30/08	79.00
	"	7/1/08	7/13/08	37.50
	"	7/14/08	9/30/08	245.80
	Laboratory	10/1/08	3/12/09	590.00
				952.30

State Universities Civil Service System
Western Illinois University
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Positions Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee	Classification	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Tyson, Roberta	Office Support Associate	Central Illinois Adult Education Ctr	6/9/08	6/30/08	118.00
			7/1/08	10/30/08	584.50
			12/1/08	12/23/08	127.50
			2/2/09	6/30/09	786.00
			7/1/09	7/15/09	77.00
			8/26/09	12/23/09	629.00
					2322.00
Hopping, Trent	Plumber	Building Mechanical	1/28/09	4/30/09	531.00
			5/1/09	6/30/09	222.50
			7/1/09	7/24/09	125.00
			8/24/09	2/5/10	592.00
					1470.50
Kipling, B.J.	Office Support Associate	Document and Publications	7/1/07	12/31/07	637.50
			2/1/08	4/14/08	260.00
			4/15/08	6/30/08	219.00
			7/1/08	7/13/08	36.00
			7/14/08	8/10/08	80.00
			8/11/08	9/30/08	95.00
			11/1/08	1/19/09	120.00
			1/20/09	5/31/09	180.50
			7/1/09	9/20/09	120.00
			9/21/09	2/28/10	130.00
					1878.00
Multiple Incumbents	Laboratory Animal Caretaker	Animal Laboratory	8/20/07	5/9/08	284.00
			5/10/08	6/30/08	56.00
			7/1/08	6/30/09	372.00
			8/12/09	6/30/10	198.00
					910.00

State Universities Civil Service System
Western Illinois University
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Positions Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee	Classification	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Hedblade, Frances G.	Clerical Assistant	Registrar	9/24/07	12/21/07	218.00
			1/2/08	5/2/08	362.00
			6/2/08	6/30/08	89.00
			7/1/08	7/13/08	37.00
			7/14/08	12/23/08	539.50
			1/5/09	4/9/09	278.50
			5/11/09	6/30/09	156.50
			7/1/09	9/20/09	258.00
			9/21/09	4/30/10	288.50
					2227.00
Multiple Incumbents	Clerical Assistant	Financial Aid	8/1/07	1/11/08	649.60
			2/25/08	5/2/08	287.00
			7/1/08	7/13/08	266.00
			7/7/08	7/13/08	20.00
			7/14/08	7/18/08	17.50
			7/14/08	8/22/08	162.20
			7/23/08	8/22/08	125.50
					1527.80
Russell, Dorvea J.	Clerk	Registrar	7/1/07	12/21/07	490.50
			1/2/08	1/31/08	40.00
			3/3/08	6/30/08	325.50
			7/1/08	7/13/08	33.00
			7/14/08	12/23/08	441.00
			1/5/09	1/30/09	67.50
			3/2/09	6/30/09	331.50
			7/1/09	9/20/09	200.00
			9/21/09	1/29/10	254.50
					2183.50
John, Mary J.	Clerk	UU Administrative	7/2/07	12/21/07	464.50
			1/4/08	6/6/08	421.00
			8/25/08	12/19/08	297.50
			1/20/09	5/15/09	300.50
					1483.50

State Universities Civil Service System
Western Illinois University
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Positions Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee	Classification	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Riedel, Beverly K.	Clerk	UHDS Residence Halls	10/8/07	12/17/07	277.50
			1/10/08	5/13/08	509.00
			8/14/08	12/23/08	552.00
			1/15/09	3/31/09	315.00
			5/1/09	5/21/09	115.00
			8/13/09	12/11/09	610.00
					2378.50
Henson, Catherine G.	Chief Clerk	Mail Services	8/13/07	6/30/08	635.70
			8/1/08	6/30/09	325.00
			8/1/09	9/20/09	47.50
			9/21/09	11/13/09	22.50
					1030.70
Multiple Incumbents	Electrician	Physical Plant	10/8/07	1/25/08	525.00
			3/3/08	6/30/08	562.50
			7/1/08	8/20/08	262.50
			7/29/09	8/28/09	166.50
			7/29/09	8/28/09	165.00
					1681.50
Multiple Incumbents	Medical Radiographer I	Beu Health Center	9/8/08	9/30/08	53.00
			10/1/08	6/29/09	819.30
			8/3/09	9/20/09	183.00
			9/3/09	9/20/09	41.00
			9/21/09	10/19/09	108.00
			9/22/09	12/31/09	79.50
					1283.80
Howe, Amy R.	Account Technician I	Temporary Assistance	1/2/08	5/11/08	660.00
			5/12/08	6/30/08	225.00
			7/31/08	12/5/08	645.00
			1/5/09	6/25/09	883.00
					2413.00

State Universities Civil Service System
Western Illinois University
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Positions Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee	Classification	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Moss, Alice L.	Medical Technologist I	Laboratory	10/1/08	3/12/09	590.00
			4/13/09	6/30/09	152.50
			7/1/09	9/20/09	62.00
			9/21/09	12/18/09	135.70
					940.20
Merritt, Lauren M.	Clerk	BEU Health Center	7/1/07	12/14/07	872.00
			1/14/08	6/26/08	871.00
			7/28/08	12/12/08	714.50
			1/12/09	6/30/09	893.50
			7/31/09	9/20/09	261.50
			9/21/09	10/16/09	99.50
					3712.00