

# STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

*Sunnycrest Center  
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24  
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099*



**Joanne E. Maitland**  
*Merit Board Chair*  
**Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock**  
*Executive Director*

April 27, 2010

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland  
Merit Board Chair  
State Universities Civil Service System

Ms. Karen Hasara  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. James D. Montgomery  
Merit Board Vice Chair  
State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. Lawrence Oliver II  
Merit Board Member  
State Universities Civil Service System

Dr. Stanley O. Ikenberry  
Interim President  
University of Illinois

Dr. Robert Easter  
Interim Provost and Vice Chancellor for  
Academic Affairs  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Mr. Walter Knorr  
Vice President/Chief Financial Officer  
University of Illinois

Ms. Maureen Parks  
Assistant Vice President for University  
Human Resources  
University of Illinois

Ms. Elyne G. Cole  
Associate Provost for Human Resources  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Ms. Julie Zemaitis  
Executive Director of University Audits  
University of Illinois

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. The audit period tested was September 1, 2006 through January 31, 2009. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock  
Executive Director

---

---

# University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign Final Audit Report

---



## State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

April 27, 2010

Audit Period

September 1, 2006 to January 31, 2009

---

Prepared by:

Lucinda M. Neitzel  
Audit and Advisory Services Manager

**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Table of Contents**

|  |          |
|--|----------|
| <b>Introduction.....</b>   | <b>1</b> |
| <b>Executive Summary .....</b>   | <b>3</b> |
| <b>Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and<br/>Additional Auditor Comments .....</b> | <b>4</b> |

**Appendices**

- Appendix A: Principal Administrative Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications
- Appendix B: Principal Administrative Appointments Review and Analysis of Position Descriptions
- Appendix C: Academic Hourly Appointments Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications



**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Introduction**

**PURPOSE**

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) ([110 ILCS 70/36b\(3\)](#)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#))] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” ([80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140\(c\)](#)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted June 15 through 19 and June 29 through July 2, 2009. An exit conference was conducted on February 1, 2010 and provided an opportunity for the Employer to discuss both the Material and Non-material findings contained in the initial Draft Audit Report. Upon completion of the exit conferences and submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and a Supplemental Report (Non-material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office for internal use.

**OVERVIEW**

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**

The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted on-site for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.

- **Compensation Programs**

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer's use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer's compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA)**

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

Jeff Brownfield, Assistant Director

Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager

Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant



**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Executive Summary**  
**YEAR ENDED – FY2009**

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act ([110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.](#)), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#)), [State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals](#), applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

**SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Number of</u></b>                | <b><u>This Report</u></b> |
|--|---------------------------|
| Findings                               | 3                         |
| Repeated findings from previous audit® | 2®                        |

**SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS**

| <b><u>Item<br/>Number</u></b> | <b><u>Page</u></b> | <b><u>Description</u></b>  |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|--|
| UIUC FY09-01                  | 4                  | FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT)<br>Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil<br>Service Classification Specifications® |
| UIUC FY09-02                  | 7                  | Exemption Authorization Applied to 'Academic Hourly' Positions<br>That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications®                                  |
| UIUC FY09-03                  | 10                 | Failure to Properly Utilize and Maintain Electronic Examination<br>(E-test) Materials  |

**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action**  
**Plan**

**UIUC FY09-01**      Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 36\(e\)](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Principal Administrative Appointments Procedures Manual, Section 1.3 Exemption Procedures](#)
- 4) [Principal Administrative Appointments Procedures Manual, Section 1.5 Reviews of Exempted Positions](#)
- 5) [Principal Administrative Appointments Procedures Manual, Section 1.8 Changing a Principal Administrative Appointment \(PAA to a Civil Service Position\)](#)
- 6) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)
- 7) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 3.1 Principal Administrative Appointments](#)
- 8) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review](#)
- 9) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions is required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

A Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) is defined as an employee who is charged with high level administrative responsibilities, whose decisions are based on administrative policies and who exercises discretion and independent judgment. However, as in any classification plan, there may be some overlap between current civil service classification specifications and the position standards under certain general PAA titles.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification. In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions



- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a 36e(3) exemption, the employer may be required to change the position from an exempt position to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

Through a review of approximately one-hundred fifty (150) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that thirty (30) exempted positions, listed in **Appendix A**, were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications.

As further listed in **Appendix B**, it was determined that seventy-one (71) position descriptions did not contain key position description elements to validate exemption from civil service or otherwise clearly define the position to enable some comparison to the class plan. Many of these position descriptions did not indicate or outline minimum acceptable qualifications and/or educational requirements. In some instances, job duties and responsibilities were extremely vague and lacked substantive content in describing the position. Fundamental baseline position description standards were not documented in validating these exemptions.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

According to the Employer, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions. Additionally, positions designated as Principal Administrative Appointments are decentralized and the Employer does not have a system in place to track or update them.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

**Finding from Previous Audit:**

The Auditor identified various 36e(3) positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classification(s) in FY2007. [*Finding Code FY2007, pages 12-34*].

**Recommendation:**

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in [Section 36\(e\)](#) of the Act and other related procedures, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when



the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed in **Appendix A** to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible, but no later than at such time that these positions become vacant. We refer the Employer to the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#), for guidance should they decide to move any of these positions immediately.

The Employer may also utilize the Pilot Program classification designations and transition the positions to be reviewed to one of these classifications if appropriate. These [Pilot Program](#) classifications utilize more flexible employment protocols and would offer a more transparent transition.

Classification plan management protocols include base line standards for exemption authorization and evolve simply around one fundamental concept, an evaluation of the position description. At a minimum, these protocols include accurate and concise job duties and responsibilities, minimum qualifications, and educational requirements. Without these components in place, it is impossible to validate the exemption authorization for many of these positions as required by System guidelines and regulations, possibly resulting in a significant level of non-compliance.

With respect to the seventy-one (71) position descriptions listed in **Appendix B**, it is recommended that the Employer revise and update them to reflect accurate and concise job duties and responsibilities, minimum qualifications, and educational requirements. The Employer is asked to forward the updated position descriptions for further review to determine if they fall within the provided civil service classification plan.

It is also recommended that the Employer establish additional business procedures to provide a more comprehensive position description model in order for positions to be easily identified and/or approved for proper exemption or inclusion within the standard civil service classification structure.

**Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Elyne G. Cole, Associate Provost for Human Resources**

We appreciate your continuing concerns about exempting positions from civil service. We remain dedicated to classifying positions as civil service when appropriate. As a result, we are developing a process to work with units to review and update the identified position descriptions for which you have requested additional review.

**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action**  
**Plan**

**UIUC FY09-02**      Exemption Authorization Applied to ‘Academic Hourly’ Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 36\(e\)](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.70\(f\) Extra Help Appointments](#)
- 4) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.80 Status Appointments](#)
- 5) [Classification Procedures Manual, Section 2.2 Job Descriptions](#)
- 6) [Employment Procedures Manual, Section 2.5 Extra Help Appointments](#)
- 7) [Principal Administrative Appointment Procedures Manual](#)
- 8) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are civil service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring documented exemption approval from the System Office or, when standard titles are used, verification of exemption authorization through the position description. Accordingly, a periodic review of position descriptions is required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain current and valid.

Employees hired by the University to any position whose duties match the specifications of any Civil Service Classification may be temporarily employed in various non-status civil service appointments, including Extra Help. Guidelines for Extra Help positions and Extra Help appointments are contained in the Illinois Administrative Code. Understanding the need for continued temporary assistance, Extra Help extensions are allowed in specific instances in accordance with procedural guidelines.

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

“Academic hourly” is an employment designation created by the Employer and defined within their internal procedures. According to University protocols, these positions are considered exempt from civil service guidelines. Designation and employment of these “academic hourly” appointments are usually the responsibility of the employing department, and therefore the employment activities and corresponding position descriptions are managed and maintained within the employing department.

Through a review of approximately fifty (50) “academic hourly” position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that thirty-three (33) positions, listed in **Appendix C**, were performing duties matching the specifications for various Civil Service classifications. In addition, only five (5) of those position descriptions cited in this finding outlined any minimum acceptable qualifications or educational requirements. In some



instances, job duties and responsibilities were extremely vague and lacked substantive content in describing the position. Fundamental baseline position description standards were not documented in validating these exemptions.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

It appears the Employer's Human Resource Department does not play a significant role in the employment process for many of these exempt "academic hourly" appointments, and therefore has a limited monitoring capacity to ensure proper position description management, regulatory compliance, and exemption designation/authorization. Employing units do not seem to be following standardized employment protocols consistent with exemption authorization standards and regulatory compliance.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

Irrespective of a position's status (temporary/permanent) or its designation, "academic hourly" in this instance, positions may only be exempted from civil service guidelines in accordance with the Act, Code, and Procedures Manuals. Failure to follow these statutory guidelines and properly categorize exempt positions results in a circumvention of standard civil service employment protocols and is considered a significant compliance violation.

Additionally, temporary positions that match the specifications of Civil Service classifications should be properly categorized and employed in accordance with standardized civil service guidelines, such as "Extra Help".

**Finding from Previous Audit:**

The Auditor reviewed the exemption authorization and employment protocols surrounding the use of Academic Hourly appointments. It was indicated that these appointments were exempted under Section 36e(4) of the Act. *[Finding Code FY2007, pages 42-43]*

**Recommendation:**

Because this topic has resurfaced as a material finding, the Employer is reminded that exemption authorization is a direct statutory responsibility delegated to the Merit Board, who has specifically empowered Employers through various procedures to make these determinations in some instances. The Designated Employer Representative (DER) of each university and affiliated agency has the responsibility to develop and maintain protocols consistent with the statutory and procedural guidelines related to this important delegated authority. Consistent with this intent, such primary exemption authority was never intended to be relegated to other campus officials without some basic accountability standards and protocols properly administered through the Designated Employer Representative or the major campus Human Resource Office.

In order to properly regulate and manage these appointments, we again recommend that the Human Resource Office establish protocols to routinely review and maintain all "academic hourly" position descriptions, and update for job content as required on a routine and regular basis or every three years, in accordance with the [Classification Procedures Manual, Section 2.2 Job Descriptions](#) and the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#). Based on a regular position review, the Employer should be able to properly identify those "academic hourly" positions that either truly should be a civil service appointment, such as Extra Help, or

meets the standard 36e(4) definition such as Teaching, Research, or Extension Faculty and has a direct link to an academic component.

It is recommended that the Employer review and update their classification plan management protocols to include the establishment of a periodic position development and maintenance process for all Principal Administrative Appointments/Exemptions, including exempt 'academic hourly' positions, in accordance with the Exemption Procedures Manual. We further recommend that the University review the position descriptions listed in **Appendix C**, in order to most appropriately determine the proper employment category. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, or an "Extra Help" appointment as appropriate, they must be transitioned as soon as possible.

**Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Elyne G. Cole, Associate Provost for Human Resources**

We recognize your concerns about appropriately classifying temporary positions. We will review all of the identified positions and take appropriate action. Additionally, we will review the protocol for evaluation of academic hourly positions in order to fulfill our continued commitment to properly classify temporary positions.



**University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign**  
**Final Audit Report**

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans**  
**and Additional Auditor Comments**

**UIUC FY09-03**      Failure to Properly Utilize and Maintain Electronic Examination (E-test) Materials

**Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):**

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 70/36b\(2\)](#)
- 2) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 70/36d\(5\)\(7\)](#)
- 3) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.50\(d\)\(2-3\) Character of Examinations](#)
- 4) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.50\(f\)\(1\) Rating of Examinations](#)
- 5) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.140\(a\)\(b\) Delegation of Authority and Responsibilities](#)

Section 70/36b(2) of the Act states “The purpose of the University System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for the Illinois Community College Board, Southern Illinois University, Chicago State University, Eastern Illinois University, Governors State University, Illinois State University, Northeastern Illinois University, Northern Illinois University, Western Illinois University, University of Illinois, State Universities Civil Service System, State Universities Retirement System, the Illinois Student Assistance Commission, and the Board of Higher Education. All certificates, appointments, and promotions to positions in these agencies and institutions shall be made solely on the basis of merit and fitness, to be ascertained by examination, except as specified in Section 36e.”

Section 70/36d(5) of the Act refers to Power and duties of the Merit Board, “To prescribe standards of examination for each class, the examinations to be related to the duties of such class. The Merit Board shall have power to delegate to the Director and his staff the preparation, conduct and grading of examinations. Examinations may be written, oral, by statement of training and experience, in the form of tests of knowledge, skill, capacity, intellect, aptitude; or, by any other method, which in the judgment of the Merit Board is reasonable and practical for any particular classification. Different examining procedures may be determined for the examinations in different classifications but all examinations in the same classification shall be uniform.”

Section 70/36d(7) of the Act refers to Power and duties of the Merit Board, “To cause to be established from the results of examinations registers for each class of positions in the classified service of the State Universities Civil Service System, of the persons who shall attain the minimum mark fixed by the Merit Board for the examination; and such persons shall take rank upon the registers as candidates in the order of the relative excellence as determined by examination, without reference to priority of time of examination.”



Section 250.50(d)(2-3) of the Code states, "Character of Examinations. All examination content shall be provided by the staff of the System." Additionally, paragraph three states, "All examination supplies and materials and all examinations are the property of the System."

Section 250.50(f)(1) of the Code states, "Rating of Examinations. The Director and his staff shall use appropriate scientific techniques and procedures in rating tests and in determining resulting rank to the end that all competitors receive uniform and fair treatment."

As stated in Section 250.140 of the Code, "Delegation of Authority and Responsibilities":

- a) "Delegation to the Executive Director. The Executive Director is delegated the authority and responsibility to effectively administer the State Universities Civil Service System in accordance with the Act and this Part. The Executive Director may be further delegated the authority and responsibility to act on behalf of the Merit Board by specific authorization or direction of the Merit Board."
- b) "Delegation by the Executive Director. The Executive Director is authorized to delegate to the employer, and to members of the University System staff, such duties and responsibilities as, in his/her judgment, are appropriate and effective for the efficient administration of the service of the System to its constituent institutions and agencies."
- c) "Conduct of Audits. The Executive Director shall conduct ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the Act and this Part and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers and shall prepare, distribute, and follow up on audit reports in accordance with Merit Board direction."

**Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):**

Upon review of the application process, testing procedures, and corresponding employment registers to verify the proper admittance to testing and referral to positions, the Auditor compared specific position registers from the Employer to the respective E-test registers on file at the System Office. The Auditor discovered several data discrepancies which concluded that the Employer is currently not utilizing the E-test system, and corresponding data elements as required, thereby jeopardizing the integrity and security of the entire system.

As of January 30, 2009, 5,431 out of 5,460 applicants, entered into E-test by the Employer, did not have a proper four (4) digit social security number assigned to them. In these instances, the Employer had simply used '0000' to identify applicants.

As of January 30, 2009, twenty-two (22) out of 5,460 applicants, entered into E-test by the Employer, were shown to have been credited with veteran's preference points. This is not a realistic mathematical possibility, since there were twenty-seven (27) applicants referred and hired from the sample of seventy-eight (78) personnel records reviewed on-site with proof of verified eligibility for veteran's preference. Additionally, of the approximately 5,000 knowledge tests completed in E-test, only ninety-seven (97) of those applicants are identified as



promotional, which also does not appear to be mathematically accurate considering the large number of applicants contained in the system by this Employer.

According to personnel records maintained by the Employer, an Office Support Assistant (U58825) was hired on 7/14/2008. The Auditor attempted to conduct an E-test register data comparison and discovered that there was not a valid typing test for this employee noted in E-test and therefore a register could not be found in the E-test system.

According to personnel records and registers reviewed on-site and maintained by the Employer, three (3) veteran applicants, one Electrician (U58813), one Office Support Associate (U88761), and one Building Service Worker (U86300), were referred and properly awarded veteran's preference points. The Auditor attempted to conduct an E-test register data comparison and discovered that these applicants were not credited with their respective veteran's preference points within the E-test system. This lead to a disparity between the registers reviewed on campus and the registers reviewed in E-test.

When reviewing the E-test registers for three Electricians with dates of appointment of 4/23/2007, 12/3/2007, and 12/4/2007 respectively, it was discovered that the employee hired on 4/23/2007 remained on the E-test register until the next two applicants were subsequently referred on 10/15/2007 and hired 12/3/2007 and 12/4/2007. This indicates that the register data for the E-test system is not routinely updated as required in order to maintain the credibility and security within this statewide system.

**Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):**

The Employer is not properly utilizing or maintaining the Electronic Testing (E-test) system established by the System Office, resulting in several inaccuracies and data discrepancies.

**Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):**

The Electronic Testing (E-test) component was designed and implemented by the System Office as a standardized and highly effective testing platform and register maintenance system. The data maintained in this system is critical to ensuring applicants are evaluated based on merit and fitness as prescribed by the Act and Code. Failure to utilize the E-test system to its intended capability jeopardizes the security and integrity of the data contained system-wide for statistical and statutory compliance purposes. Such action has a potentially significant liability consequence for both the Employer and the System Office, particularly related to security and ongoing validation and statistical analysis.

The System Office has jurisdiction over all testing materials and is charged with ensuring compliance with the Act, Code, and Procedures Manuals associated with various personnel transactions within defined guidelines. Oversight in this respect is vital to ensuring that Employers do not unfairly and discriminately limit or expand the applicant pool, possibly resulting in awarding positions and employment opportunities based on a faulty premise. From a regulatory perspective, the Electronic Testing (E-test) component is designed to give the System Office a secure instrument to electronically manage the testing environment consistent with statutory requirements and properly maintain analytical validation components.



**Finding from Previous Audit:**

No findings in this topic area were made during the last operational audit in FY2007.

**Recommendation:**

It is recommended that the Employer implement policies and procedures to insure that all applicants who meet the Minimum Acceptable Qualifications (MAQs) prescribed by any designated classification specification that are admitted to the proper form of examination, be properly entered into the Electronic Test (E-test) system with all data elements properly entered and maintained, as required by the State Universities Civil Service System employment testing and register maintenance protocols.

Most specifically, it is recommended that the Employer's practices with respect to electronic application processing should be modified to accommodate the employment protocols and examination processing procedures prescribed through the State Universities Civil Service Act, Code, and Procedures Manuals. Additionally, it is recommended that the Employer review the employment and application processing activities conducted during this audit time frame and make necessary adjustments to ensure that data integrity with respect to E-test is updated and properly maintained.

**Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Elyne G. Cole, Associate Provost for Human Resources**

We do have policies and procedures in place to insure that all applicants who meet the Minimum Acceptable Qualifications are admitted to the proper form of examination, and the test scores of these applicants are properly entered into our register maintenance system. We absolutely meet all the requirements referred to in this finding, and there is no risk to the integrity of our data. There are no specific findings that indicate that our testing methods are inappropriate, that our data is at risk, etc. Yet the wording of the above recommendation suggests that we do. This would lead our administration to believe we are compromising the integrity of our testing system and/or the data that is involved. We are surprised at this recommendation because this discussion did not come up during the onsite audit visit. We believe that this evaluation is not a fair reflection of our current procedures. The five "findings" that you discuss on page 9 and 10 of the Interim Report are based on how our results appear in your System, which might appear incorrect. But we have verified that each is correctly maintained in our internal register maintenance system, which is the "system of record," as has been discussed with, and accepted by, the System Office on many occasions.

By way of background, in 2005, while the System's E-test was being developed, the Associate Vice President for Human Resources at the University of Illinois advised the System that the University would only be using the E-test portion of the SUCSS electronic system. We also advised that we would not use any portion of the E-test process that would require duplicate entry. Additionally, we had an existing system (PRMS) that fully met all of the requirements of the Civil Service System regarding testing and register maintenance. Since the implementation of the electronic testing system provided by the Civil Service System office, our system (PRMS)



continues to provide greater functionality than that of the SUCSS electronic system which allows us the ability to maintain full compliance with Civil Service rules.

**Additional Auditor Comments:**

While the Employer has emphasized their compliance with the overall testing and register maintenance requirements within their own PRMS personnel system, it is important to note that there is recognition that many important data elements within the E-test system are intentionally entered incorrectly or merely omitted. The State Universities Civil Service System, not this specific employer, is held strictly accountable for the civil service employment process. The Employer's responsibility, through secure access to E-test, is to ensure compliance in maintaining all of the data components of the E-test system in this respect.

From a global perspective, the Civil Service employment process contains several other compliance elements than merely processing the University of Illinois Urbana/Champaign hiring transactions. Data elements obtained through this E-test system from ALL employers are utilized for important and ongoing validation studies, verification of applicant eligibility, statewide mandated testing and referral protocols, ongoing monitoring of test bias, and many other important business operations vital to the overall statewide civil service employment process and our agency statutory obligations. This can only be completed through the correct entry of information in E-test, and is not captured at all in PRMS. The PRMS merely captures a composite of information important to UIUC business operations. Implementing and enforcing policies that actually prohibit the proper utilization and data maintenance of the E-test system has a potentially significant liability consequence for both the Employer and the System Office, particularly related to information security, ongoing validation, statistical analysis, required reporting parameters, and other important agency business operations and statutory obligations. As stated in the Auditor's recommendation, the failure to properly update and utilize the E-test system, which is the official "system of record", not only jeopardizes the security and reliability of the overall statewide system, but also exposes both the agency and employer to significant liability with reference to statistical and statutory compliance obligations.

During the Exit Conference, it was the impression of the Auditor that the Employer was willing to work collaboratively with the System Office and provide suggestions to make process improvements with respect to E-test system elements. ***It is of utmost importance that identified data elements in E-test are correctly entered and information properly maintained.*** Since this testing instrument is controlled at the System Office level, we concur that there are some system modifications that could be made on the front-end which may prevent duplicate entry within the Employer's HR Office. It is our intent to continue providing assistance to the Employer in this respect to develop more effective internal protocols consistent with our efforts to foster positive and collaborative relationships. As the System Office continues in its ongoing commitment to operational efficiency and sophistication within our testing processes, we will plan to schedule a time with appropriate HR personnel to review E-test data entry and maintenance requirements and establish protocols for strict compliance in this respect. ***Again, it is of utmost importance that identified data elements in E-test are correctly entered and information properly maintained.*** This is a very fundamental requirement of all employers when allowed access to these highly important, complex secure database systems.

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

| <b>Employee</b>    | <b>Position Number</b> | <b>Recommended Civil Service Classification</b>  |
|--------------------|------------------------|--|
| Benjamin, Anthony  | U72105/00              | Web Specialist Series or Webmaster   |
| Billman, Becky     | U81204/00              | Human Resource Series or Human Resource Associate  |
| Brown, Andrea      | U54202/00              | Web Specialist Series or Webmaster   |
| Dehler, Geoffrey   | U22072/00              | Accountant Series, Account Technician Series, Accounting Associate, or Administrative Assistant Series |
| Fernandez, Pedro   | U59598/00              | Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator  |
| Haas, Stephanie    | U46829/00              | Human Resource Series or Human Resource Associate  |
| Hainline, Courtney | U59545/00              | Graduate Placement Officer, Program Adviser, or Administrative Aide                                    |
| Hansen, Kimberly   | U54205/00              | Admissions & Records Series  |
| Horn, Heather      | U82520/00              | Human Resource Series or Human Resource Associate  |
| Jarboe, Jill       | U50730/00              | Assistant Director of Alumni Relations   |
| Kent, Sarah        | U95868/00              | Microcomputer Support Specialist Series or University Network Specialist Series                        |
| Kirkham, Brian     | U84476/00              | Network Engineer Series or Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator                   |
| Landrus, Steven    | U81754/00              | Ticket Sales Series  |
| Mosley, Jill       | U11080/00              | Manager of University Cashiering Operations or Cashier Series  |



**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

| <b>Employee</b>     | <b>Position Number</b> | <b>Recommended Civil Service Classification</b>  |
|---------------------|------------------------|--|
| Munson, Heather     | U91828/00              | Associate Director of Publications or Publications Series  |
| Myrick, Leslie      | U65195/00              | Associate Director of Publications or Publications Series  |
| Nelson, Elizabeth   | U72927/00              | Associate Director of Publications or Public Information Series  |
| O'Donnell, Sadi     | U88405/00              | Grants & Contracts Administrator Series  |
| Otto, Jennifer      | U22079/00              | Grants & Contracts Administrator Series  |
| Patton, Christopher | U90366/00              | Grants & Contracts Administrator Series  |
| Powell, Eric B.     | U54203/00              | Admissions/Records Specialist Series or Admissions and Records Series  |
| Robertson, Colin    | U62214/00              | Administrative Assistant Series or Administrative Aide   |
| Schweitzer, Noel    | U22114/00              | Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator  |
| Shroyer, Joe        | U59283/00              | Administrative Assistant Series or Business/Administrative Associate   |
| Strauss, Linh       | U83773/00              | Accountant Series or Accounting Associate  |
| Vacant              | U43022/00              | Webmaster or Graphic Designer Series   |
| Vacant              | U58665/00              | Environmental Health & Safety Technician Series  |
| Vlach, Peter        | U12134/00              | Microcomputer Support Specialist Series, Information Technology Technical Associate, or Information Technology Support Associate |

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix A**

*Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications*

| <b>Employee</b>   | <b>Position Number</b> | <b>Recommended Civil Service Classification</b>  |
|-------------------|------------------------|--|
| Willard, Jedediah | U05068/00              | Web Specialist Series or Webmaster   |
| Yeh, Rosanna      | U78161/00              | Information Technology Management Series, Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator, or Information Technology Technical Associate |



**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix B**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Requiring Further Analysis/Development***

| Employee           | Position Number | Position Title  |
|--------------------|-----------------|---|
| Benjamin, Anthony  | U72105/00       | Web & Database Specialist                                   |
| Borukhovich, Yury  | U86222/00       | Web Development Specialist                                  |
| Briggs, Mark       | U77535/00       | Campus Risk Manager   |
| Brighton, John     | U77273/00       | Assistant Director of Broadcasting for Internet Development |
| Brown, Kate        | U98493/00       | Housing Research Specialist                                 |
| Burdette, Gregory  | U84788/00       | Assistant Director of IT Operations                         |
| Cai, Yandong Dora  | U64628/00       | Senior Database Architect                                   |
| Campbell, Mary     | U91988/00       | Assistant Coordinator, Senior Odyssey                       |
| Campbell, Michael  | U64029/00       | Principal Research Programmer                               |
| Carpenter, Jeffrey | U75148/00       | Multimedia Technology Specialist                            |
| Chen, Daniel       | U85553/00       | Visiting Engineer   |
| Cook, Colleen      | U97655/00       | Digital Media Coordinator                                   |
| Cotler, Angelina   | U42594/00       | Associate Director of CLACS                                 |
| Danielson, Michael | U58741/00       | Assistant Director of Student Development                   |
| Dong, Feng         | U03000/00       | Database Programmer/Applications Developer                  |
| Frey, Roxanne      | U63573/00       | Director of Advancement                                     |
| Gordon, Dorothy    | U77663/00       | Assistant to the Head                                       |
| Greist, Debra      | U53498/00       | Assistant Director for Administration                       |

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix B**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Requiring Further Analysis/Development***

| Employee           | Position Number | Position Title                                    |
|--------------------|-----------------|---|
| Haas, Stephanie    | U46829/00       | Human Resources Specialist                        |
| Hainline, Courtney | U59545/00       | Assistant Director, MBA Student Affairs           |
| Hanna, Chris       | U78214/00       | Assistant Director of Athletics                   |
| Heggemeyer, Amy    | U95891/00       | Assistant Registrar                               |
| Heggemeyer, Jason  | U62339/00       | Assistant Director of Ticket Operations           |
| Hembrey, Sheryl    | U93113/00       | Assistant Director for Budget & Resource Planning |
| Henze, Tonja       | U67558/00       | Lab Animal Facilities Coordinator                 |
| Herricks, Susan    | U80082/00       | Educational Programs Coordinator                  |
| Hile, Tessa        | U93991/00       | Assistant Director of Financial Operations        |
| Horn, Heather      | U82520/00       | Human Resources Manager                           |
| Hsieh, Jonathan    | U99340/00       | Accessible Development Specialist                 |
| Hurst, Stephen     | U90621/00       | Research Programmer                               |
| Jarboe, Jill       | U50730/00       | Alumni & Student Relations Coordinator            |
| Jeffers, Diane     | U81305/00       | Coordinator of External Relations                 |
| Kelley, John       | U80516/00       | Director of Advancement & Alumni Relations        |
| Kent, Sarah        | U95868/00       | Manager of System Services                        |
| Kirkham, Brian     | U84476/00       | Network Specialist                                |



**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix B**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Requiring Further Analysis/Development***

| Employee              | Position Number | Position Title                                       |
|-----------------------|-----------------|--|
| Landrus, Steven       | U81754/00       | Assistant Ticket Manager                             |
| Marriott, James       | U66711/01       | Chemical Safety Professional                         |
| McDonough, Tim        | U63257/00       | Academic Director                                    |
| McGuffin, James       | U62392/00       | Assistant Director of Development                    |
| Morgan, Martha        | U85258/00       | Staff Associate                                      |
| Myrick, Leslie        | U65195/00       | Editor   |
| Nandkumar, Radha      | U80607/00       | Assistant Director, International & Campus Relations |
| Nicholson-Owens, J.B. | U10629/00       | Website & Network Administrator                      |
| Oliviero, Valerie     | U63770/00       | Assistant to the Senior Associate Director           |
| Parsons, Steve        | U73595/00       | Complex Director                                     |
| Partin, Richard       | U06177/00       | Coordinator for Outreach & External Relations        |
| Perilongo, Joseph     | U88135/00       | Chemical Waste Professional                          |
| Perry, Denise         | U91861/00       | Broadcast Systems Manager--Traffic                   |
| Peterson, William P.  | U00258/00       | Assistant Director of Communications                 |
| Pettigrew, Kristina   | U91753/00       | Assistant Director of Member Services                |
| Purpura, Allyson      | U07927/00       | Curator, Krannert Art Museum                         |
| Reagan, Maureen       | U84522/00       | Assistant Director for Marketing & Patron Services   |

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix B**

***Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Requiring Further Analysis/Development***

| Employee          | Position Number | Position Title                                |
|-------------------|-----------------|---|
| Redlinski, Lisa   | U70965/00       | University Housing/Residential Life Librarian |
| Robertson, Colin  | U62214/00       | Program Specialist                            |
| Schueller, Kari   | U62814/00       | Program Coordinator                           |
| Smith, Jason      | U84512/00       | Workstation Systems Administrator             |
| Stone, Joshua     | U81379/00       | IT Security Officer                           |
| Strom, Ritchie    | U77220/00       | Creative Specialist in Broadcasting           |
| Suttle, Tony      | U91365/00       | Instructional Media Planner                   |
| Sweet, Todd       | U70223/00       | Assistant Director of Advanced Media          |
| Trail, James      | U86574/00       | Retail Services Coordinator                   |
| Vacant            | U53439/00       | Process Engineer                              |
| Vacant            | U55110/00       | Assistant to the Director                     |
| Vacant            | U73238/00       | Area Coordinator                              |
| Vacant            | U80420/00       | Conference Center Marketing Director          |
| Westgren, Lynn    | U64168/00       | Program Coordinator                           |
| White, Jennifer   | U79436/00       | Registrar                                     |
| Willard, Jedidiah | U05068/00       | Web Specialist                                |
| Williams, Paula   | U66479/00       | Assistant to the Associate Director           |



**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix B**

*Principal Administrative Appointments  
Position Descriptions Requiring Further Analysis/Development*

| Employee       |  | Position<br>Number | Position Title                    |
|----------------|--|--------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Wilson, Walter |  | U88071/00          | Design & Installation Specialist  |
| Yeh, Rosanna   |  | U78161/00          | Information Technology Specialist |

**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix C**

*Academic Hourly Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications*

| <b>Employee</b>       | <b>Position Number</b> | <b>Recommended Civil Service Classification</b>  |
|-----------------------|------------------------|--|
| Barrett, Gerald       | U61283/00              | Graphic Designer Series, Publications Series, or Administrative Extra Help                                 |
| Breitenbach, Loryl D. | U66005/02              | Archeological Assistant Series or Professional Extra Help  |
| Clark, Linda          | U45003/00              | Web Specialist Series or Technical Extra Help  |
| Dauer, Richard L.     | U71324/00              | Archeological Assistant Series or Professional Extra Help  |
| Debatin, Becky        | U60876/00              | Administrative Aide or Clerical Extra Help   |
| Elliot, Michael       | U66206/00              | Administrative Assistant Series or Clerical Extra Help   |
| Erickson, Aurora      | U30144/00              | Curator of Anthropology Series or Administrative Extra Help  |
| Franch, John          | U40025/00              | Library Series or Administrative Extra Help  |
| Fullen, Brittany      | U66104/00              | Archeological Assistant Series or Professional Extra Help  |
| Groves, Peter         | U64671/00              | Microcomputer Support Specialist Series, Information Technology Support Associate, or Technical Extra Help |
| Harden, Martha        | U22136/00              | Administrative Assistant Series, Business/Administrative Associate, or Administrative Extra Help           |
| Hulick, Jeannette     | U55079/00              | Editorial Series or Administrative Extra Help  |
| Illyes, Robert        | U81844/01              | Applications Programmer Series, Information Technology Technical Associate, or Technical Extra Help        |
| Ippel, Joshua T.      | U00035/00              | Museum Exhibits Series, Curator of Art Series, or Professional Extra Help                                  |
| Jones, John M.        | U77667/00              | Admissions & Records Series, Admissions/Records Specialist Series, or Administrative Extra Help            |
| Kerlin, Laura         | U00863/00              | Administrative Extra Help  |
| Kreps, Steven N.      | U67290/01              | Ticket Sales Series or Clerical Extra Help   |
| Lucas, Leanne         | U58565/00              | Office Support Specialist Series or Administrative Extra Help  |



**State Universities Civil Service System  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
FY2009 Compliance Audit**

**Appendix C**

*Academic Hourly Appointments  
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications*

| <b>Employee</b>    | <b>Position Number</b> | <b>Recommended Civil Service Classification</b>  |
|--------------------|------------------------|--|
| Morrison, Hope     | U55019/00              | Editorial Series or Administrative Extra Help  |
| Norris, Josh       | U66206/00              | Intramural and Recreation Coordinator or Service Extra Help  |
| Ore, Fred R.       | U82840/00              | Accountant Series, Business/Administrative Associate, or Administrative Extra Help   |
| Paceley, Cynthia   | U64998/00              | Editorial Series or Administrative Extra Help  |
| Quinlan, Matthew   | U01506/02              | Office Support Specialist Series, Training Assistant, or Administrative Extra Help   |
| Rebhi, Abdel       | U70985/00              | Technical Extra Help   |
| Roughton, Susan J. | U65025/00              | Admissions & Records Series, Admissions/Records Specialist Series, or Administrative Extra Help                              |
| Tedone, Melissa A. | U40025/00              | Administrative or Technical Extra Help   |
| Tucker, James      | U84436/00              | Technical Extra Help   |
| Vacant             | U21531/00              | Web Specialist Series, Webmaster, Information Technology Management Series, or Technical Extra Help                          |
| Velazquez, Robyn   | U33033/00              | Applications Programmer Series, Systems Programmer Series, Information Technology Support Associate, or Technical Extra Help |
| Whitson, Joshua    | U61032/00              | Construction Project Coordinator Series, Estimator, or Technical Extra Help  |
| Wong, Ho-Mui       | U59941/00              | Graphic Designer Series, Publications Series, or Administrative Extra Help   |
| Yancey, Miranda L. | U66119/03              | Archeological Assistant Series or Professional Extra Help  |
| Young, Janelle     | U66347/00              | Administrative Aide or Clerical Extra Help   |