

STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM

Sunnycrest Center
1717 Philo Road, Suite 24
Urbana, Illinois 61802-6099



Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director

July 14, 2010

Dr. Glenn Poshard
President
Southern Illinois University

Ms. Kimberly Labonte
Executive Director of Audits
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Dr. Samuel Goldman
Chancellor
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Mrs. Joanne E. Maitland
Merit Board Chair
State Universities Civil Service System

Mr. Kevin Bame
Vice Chancellor for Administration and
Finance
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Mr. John Simmons
Merit Board Member
State Universities Civil Service System

Ms. Jennifer Watson
Director of Human Resources
Designated Employer Representative
Southern Illinois University Carbondale

The State Universities Civil Service System respectfully submits the Final Audit Report of the Biennial Institutional Compliance Audit conducted at Southern Illinois University Carbondale. The audit period tested was July 1, 2007 through September 30, 2009. This report is intended to communicate the final material findings, recommendations and corresponding institutional responses formulated through a comprehensive human resource compliance and operational audit.

On behalf of the audit staff, we thank Southern Illinois University Carbondale and their human resource staff for a very productive audit experience. If there are any questions or a personal briefing on any item is desired, please call Lucinda M. Neitzel (217) 278-3150 ext. 239.

Lewis T. (Tom) Morelock
Executive Director

Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Final Audit Report



State Universities Civil Service System Compliance Audit

July 14, 2010

Audit Period

July 1, 2007 to September 30, 2009

Prepared by:

Lucinda M. Neitzel

Audit and Advisory Services Manager

Southern Illinois University Carbondale
Final Audit Report

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Executive Summary.....	4
Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and Additional Auditor Comments	5

Appendices

- Appendix A: Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications
- Appendix B: Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Southern Illinois University Carbondale Final Audit Report

Introduction

PURPOSE

The State Universities Civil Service System was created as a separate entity of the State of Illinois and is under the control of the University Civil Service Merit Board as set forth in Section 36b(3) of the State Universities Civil Service Act (Act) ([110 ILCS 70/36b\(3\)](#)). The purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System is to establish a sound program of personnel administration for its constituent employers (110 ILCS 70/36b(2)). To achieve this purpose, the Merit Board has been given a broad range of statutory powers and duties, which include the power to make rules to carry out the purpose of the State Universities Civil Service System and to appoint an Executive Director to administer the Act (110 ILCS 70/36d(11) and (12)).

As part of its statutory power, the Merit Board has promulgated rules that delegate to the Executive Director the authority and responsibility for conducting “ongoing audit programs of all Civil Service operations at all places of employment for the purpose of assuring compliance with the [Act (110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.)] and [Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#))] and for improving the programs of personnel administration of its constituent employers” ([80 Ill. Adm. Code §250.140\(c\)](#)).

This report communicates the final outcome of a comprehensive human resource operational audit, which included an on-site evaluation that was conducted January 26-29, 2010. An exit conference was conducted on June 30, 2010 and provided an opportunity for the Employer to discuss both the Material and Non-material findings contained in the initial Draft Audit Report. Upon completion of the exit conferences and submission of the Institutional Corrective Action Plan, a Final Audit Report (Material Findings only) is sent to the Employer, and a Supplemental Report (Non-material Findings) is sent to the campus/agency Human Resource Office for internal use.

OVERVIEW

The following Human Resource activities were reviewed and utilized in identifying the Material (Final Audit Report) and Non-material Findings (Supplemental Report):

- **Assignment of Positions to Classes**

The Auditor completes a review of selected job descriptions for timely updates, proper administration, and correct assignment of position classifications. Additional desk audits of selected positions are conducted onsite for appropriateness of position classifications. There is also an evaluation of the Employer’s position audit process and corresponding determinations.

- **Compensation Programs**

The Auditor completes an analysis of the Employer's use of pay rates and pay ranges, as approved by the Merit Board. An overall evaluation is then conducted of the Employer's compensation program and initiatives to meet requirements of pay equity within the Employer's market area.

- **Examination Program**

The Auditor conducts a review of pre-employment testing operations. This includes test administration, admission procedures of applicants to examinations, license and certification verifications, scheduling, security, and register management.

- **Administration of Employment and Separation Procedures**

The Auditor reviews the Employer's business processes and procedures related to the employment cycle, including pre-employment activities, probationary and status employment, and employment separation programs. There is also an assessment of the Employer's utilization and monitoring of non-status appointments.

- **Administration and Employment Protocols of Principal Administrative Appointments (PAA)**

The Auditor completes a review of the employment protocols and assigned responsibilities for Principal Administrative Appointments. This review is conducted to assure compliance with recognized exemption authorization procedures. The Employer's exemption forms and related position descriptions are reviewed and selected incumbent interviews are conducted for validation of approved exemptions. The audit process also includes a review of the Employer's administrative procedures related to these appointments and their approved exemption status.

- **General Review of the Employer's Human Resource Program**

The Auditor completes a general review of the Employer's human resource programs with respect to effectiveness, efficiency and levels of communication to constituencies. There is also an assessment of the recognition and interaction of human resource programs within the Employer's faculty, administrative and support staff employee groups. The impact of new technology on the recordkeeping and processing of information is also an element for review.

- **Other Follow-up Items from Previous Audit**

Other follow-up items from previous audits, as well as other matters deemed necessary and appropriate, may have been reviewed and submitted as additional audit topics.

The following staff members from the System Office, Audit and Advisory Services Division, were directly responsible for conducting various aspects of the audit:

[Lucinda Neitzel, Audit and Advisory Services Manager](#)

[Jeff Brownfield, Manager of Operations Division](#)

[Paula Mitchell, Human Resource Assistant](#)

Southern Illinois University Carbondale
Final Audit Report

Executive Summary
YEAR ENDED--FY2010

The compliance testing performed during this examination was conducted in accordance with State Universities Civil Service Act ([110 ILCS 70/36b et seq.](#)), Part 250 of the Illinois Administrative Code (Code) ([80 Ill. Adm. Code 250](#)), [State Universities Civil Service Procedures Manuals](#), applicable University/agency policies/procedures, and auditing standards.

SUMMARY OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Number of</u>	<u>This Report</u>
Findings	2
Repeated findings from previous audit [®]	1 [®]

SCHEDULE OF MATERIAL FINDINGS

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Description</u>
SIUC FY10-01	5	FINDINGS (STATE UNIVERSITIES CIVIL SERVICE ACT) Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications
SIUC FY10-02	8	FINDINGS (ILLINOIS ADMINISTRATIVE CODE) Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations

Southern Illinois University Carbondale
Final Audit Report

Material Findings, Recommendations, and Institutional Corrective Action Plan

SIUC FY10-01 Exemption Authorization Applied to Positions That Match Civil Service Classification Specifications

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) [State Universities Civil Service Act \(Act\), Section 36\(e\)](#)
- 2) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.30\(a\) Coverage](#)
- 3) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 1.1 Overview](#)
- 4) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 6.3 System Office Review](#)
- 5) [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2 Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#)

These guidelines provide that all positions are Civil Service, except as categorically outlined. Exemptions are allowed in accordance with procedures, requiring either documented exemption approval from the System Office or verification of exemption authorization through the position descriptions when general titles are used. Accordingly, a periodic review and update of position descriptions are required to confirm that these exemption authorizations remain valid.

Periodic job description review and update procedures may indicate that a position originally identified as a Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) may have incorrectly been classified or may have changed to the point whereby a department now must convert this position, and any employee currently occupying these positions, to an identified and appropriate Civil Service classification.

In this respect, biennial compliance audits of University System employers will include, but not be limited to:

- Comprehensive review of position descriptions
- Compliance with statutory and procedural criteria for exemptions
- Adequacy and thoroughness of related employment procedures
- Adequacy of internal review and approval processes
- Thoroughness and accuracy of quarterly reporting requirements
- Any other associated special interest items

When it has been determined and established that the job responsibilities and duties of a position do not meet the criteria for a PAA exemption under Section 36e(3), the Employer may

be required to change the position from an exempt appointment to an appropriate Civil Service appointment in a recognized classification.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

Through a review of approximately eighty (80) position descriptions, including on-site interviews with various exempted employees, it was determined that eleven (11) exempted positions, listed in **Appendix A** were performing duties matching the specifications for various civil service classifications.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

According to the Employer, 'standard' titles approved for use by the System Office were applied to the majority of the exempted positions.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

A failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations, utilization of inappropriate employment protocols, and non-compliance with the Act, Code and Procedures. Consequently, positions are improperly identified and appropriate Civil Service protocols circumvented, significantly increasing the possibility of employment issues.

Finding from Previous Audit:

The Auditor identified various 36e(3) positions that appeared to be performing duties and responsibilities comparable to those found in Civil Service classification(s) in the FY2008 compliance audits. *[Finding Code SIUC FY08-01, pages 4-5].*

Recommendation:

In accordance with the statutory intent and basic premise contained in [Section 36\(e\)](#) of the Act and other related procedures, the assignment of positions to Civil Service classifications when the position description matches appropriate classification specifications must take precedence over the use of exemptions through utilizing general titles.

We recommend that the Employer complete an in-depth review of the position descriptions for the positions listed in **Appendix A** to further determine if they meet the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications. If it is determined that these positions match the specifications of the recommended Civil Service classifications, they should be transitioned to a Civil Service appointment as soon as possible, but no later than at such time that these positions become vacant. It is strongly recommended that these positions be moved immediately, or at the next employment contract renewal date if applicable. We refer the Employer to the [Exemption Procedures Manual, Section 8.2, Changing an Exempt Position to a Civil Service Position](#) for guidance in transitioning these positions to appropriate civil service appointments.

The Employer may also utilize the Pilot Program classification designations and transition the positions to be reviewed to one of these classifications if appropriate. These [Pilot Program](#) classifications utilize more flexible employment protocols and would offer a more transparent transition.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Kathy Blackwell, Director of Human Resources

The employer understands that a failure to establish appropriate classification plan management protocols that properly update, analyze and evaluate position descriptions leads to unauthorized exemption authorizations. Prior to exemption, each position is carefully reviewed for possible inclusion in a civil service classification, and we will continue to monitor the approval of Principal Administrative Appointment (PAA) positions to ensure proper exemption standards have been met. The employer agrees to complete a review of the position descriptions for the positions listed in **Appendix A** to determine proper exemption status, and as always, the employer will also continue to monitor positions as they become vacant to determine if any previously exempted position should be considered for conversion to civil service.

Southern Illinois University Carbondale
Final Audit Report

**Material Findings, Recommendations, Institutional Corrective Action Plans and
Additional Auditor Comments**

SIUC FY10-02 Non-Compliance with Extra Help Employment and Position Limitations

Criteria/Standards (i.e., what should exist):

- 1) [Illinois Administrative Code \(Code\), Section 250.70\(f\) Extra Help Appointments](#)
- 2) [Employment and Separation Procedures Manual, Section 2.9 Extra Help Appointments](#)

Guidelines for Extra Help positions and Extra Help employees are contained in the Illinois Administrative Code. "An Extra Help appointment may be made, by an employer to any position for work which the employer attests to be casual or emergent in nature, and which meets the following conditions:

- A) the amount of time for which the services are needed is not usually predictable;
- B) payment for work performed is usually made on an hourly basis; and
- C) the work cannot readily be assigned either on a straight-time or on an overtime basis to a status employee."

"An Extra Help position may be utilized for a maximum of 900 hours of actual work in any consecutive 12 calendar months. The employer shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment which is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment. If an Extra Help position has accrued 900 consecutive hours, the position shall not be reestablished until six (6) months time has elapsed from the date of the termination of the position."

For Extra Help employees, the Code requires that "Upon working 900 hours, an Extra Help employee cannot resume employment in any Extra Help appointment at a place of employment until thirty (30) calendar days have elapsed."

The employer's responsibility as noted in the Code is that they "... shall review the status of the position at least every three calendar months. If at any time it is found that the position has become an appointment which is other than Extra Help, the employer shall terminate the Extra Help appointment." Understanding the need for continued temporary assistance, Extra Help extensions are allowed in specific instances in accordance with procedural guidelines.

Conditions/Facts (i.e., what actually exists):

As documented in **Appendix B**, seventeen (17) employees were found to have worked beyond the 900-hour Extra Help limitation without the required 30-day break in service.

The Auditor reviewed data submitted by the Employer to evaluate the Extra Help position utilization component with respect to compliance with the Illinois Administrative Code. Initially, it appeared that these positions were pooled within a few classifications/job titles since position numbers or other distinguishing characteristics were not included in the original data submitted. Based on this limited information, several Extra Help positions appeared to have been utilized for more than 900 hours of actual work within a 12 month period without a six month lapse, with many of the positions frequently having several incumbents employed through them at the same time.

Upon the Auditor's request, the Employer submitted additional information based on a small, random department and classification sampling. These additional documents did show, in a few instances, that it was possible that different positions were utilized in certain departments. However, the Employer was unable to clearly demonstrate compliance with the 900-hour position component through the data submitted.

Cause (i.e., why deficient condition occurred):

Based on the information provided by the Employer, it does not appear that adequate protocols to efficiently and effectively monitor Extra Help limitations were established or maintained, especially related to the 900-hour position utilization component. The Employer indicated that Extra Help appointments are tracked manually and that position numbers are not used in their payroll system to properly identify specific jobs within a department. While the documentation seemed to indicate that position numbers were used in some instances, the Auditor discovered this "Position ID" number was strictly used for budgetary purposes and is therefore unreliable in specifically identifying positions with respect to this topic.

It should be noted that the process of pooling extra help positions, or otherwise allowing one extra help position to be shared by an indefinite number of employees concurrently lends an additional layer of complexity and does not allow for proper position monitoring and regulating of employee work times in accordance with the Illinois Administrative Code and System Office Procedures referenced above. Based on the data analyzed, it does not appear that the required six-month lapse before a position can be reestablished has been followed in many instances, resulting in the extended use of positions beyond the 900 hour limitation.

Effect (i.e., impact of the problem):

Current Employer position management practices in this respect make it difficult to determine whether or not an Extra Help position, or employee, has exceeded employment limitations and should be terminated. Extra Help positions/people appear to be utilized longer than allowed, impacting the overall employment environment, which is inconsistent with the Code and Employment/Separation Procedures Manual.

Finding from Previous Audit:

No findings in this topic area were made during the last operational audit in FY2008.

Recommendation:

This topic was discussed with the Employer following the on-site portion of the audit. The Employer indicated that they did not have the capability to track each extra help position with a unique position number within their payroll system, and that individual position descriptions for each extra help position could be provided. This method of ensuring compliance with the rule is inefficient and ineffective due to the hundreds of Extra Help employees utilized. We recommend that the Employer identify and implement additional position management protocols that will adequately monitor and regulate Extra Help positions, and employees assigned to those positions, in accordance with Section 250.70(f) of the Code.

Additionally, to reduce the frequency of these findings, the Employer may be able to further utilize [Extra Help Extensions](#), when applicable, and/or conduct an operational analysis to determine if there is need for the creation of additional status appointments in instances where there is a long term extensive use of these positions for similar job assignments.

Institutional Corrective Action Plan—provided by Kathy Blackwell, Director of Human Resources

The Employer acknowledges that seventeen appointments (out of 4,864 Extra Help appointments) exceeded 900 consecutive hours. However, we believe it is important to note that although no automated tracking system exists, the employer does in fact utilize an extensive monitoring process, although it is a labor intensive, manual process. A separate and unique position description is maintained for each position, and hours are tracked and reported to the employing departments to notify them when an extra help employee is approaching the 900 hour limit. However, the extraction of extra help hours from our payroll system is difficult, and we will continue to work toward a more efficient monitoring process.

Additional Auditor Comments:

The Auditor acknowledges that challenges exist with extracting extra help information from the Employer's payroll system. However, with respect to the position management aspect of this topic, a manual tracking method has been inadequate in achieving full compliance. During the exit conference, it was discussed that efforts would be made by the Employer to develop a method of integrating extra help information into the new payroll system to assist in achieving compliance with respect to the position management requirement.

The Employer should be aware that this topic has been adequately addressed at other campuses utilizing similar human resource systems by implementing new compliance procedures or report tracking mechanisms, and assigning unique position numbers to each extra help position.

**State Universities Civil Service System
Southern Illinois University Carbondale
FY2010 Compliance Audit**

Appendix A

***Principal Administrative Appointments
Position Descriptions Matching Civil Service Specifications***

Job Title	Position Number	Recommended Civil Service Classification
Computer Information Specialist	C.AP.477.000	Network Specialist Coordinator, Local Area Network (LAN) Support Series, Information Technology Technical Associate, or Information Technology Support Associate
Computer Information Specialist	C.AP.1028.000	Network Specialist Coordinator, Local Area Network (LAN) Support Series, Information Technology Technical Associate, or Information Technology Support Associate
Conference Coordinator	C.AP.805.000	Special Events Facilitator, Business/Administrative Associate, or Administrative Assistant Series
Coordinator of Ticket Operations	C.AP.1291.001	Ticket Sales Series
Assistant Director of Alumni Services (Alumni Public Relations)	C.AP.363.000	Assistant Director of Alumni Relations
Assistant Director of Alumni Services (Director, Member Services)	C.AP.801.000	Assistant Director of Alumni Relations
Coordinator, Recreational Sports and Services (Facilities)	C.AP.130.000	Intramural and Recreation Coordinator or Manager of Sports Facilities
Coordinator, Recreational Sports and Services (Sport Clubs/Intramural Sports)	C.AP.131.000	Intramural and Recreation Coordinator or Manager of Sports Facilities
Coordinator of Equipment and Facilities	C.AP.1678.000	Sports Equipment Supervisor
Instructional Technology Specialist	C.AP.218.001	Information Technology Manager/Administrative Coordinator, Information Technology Management Series, or Information Technology Technical Associate
Assistant Director of University Housing	C.AP.645.001	Housing Administration Series

State Universities Civil Service System
Southern Illinois University Carbondale
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee Name	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Anderson, Benjamin M.	Information Technology	6/1/08	8/17/08	485.50
	"	8/18/08	11/27/08	559.50
				1045.00
Bristow, Phillip M.	Division of Continuing Education	1/28/08	9/30/08	913.00
Eisenhauer, Julie L.	College of Engineering	1/1/08	6/30/08	581.00
	"	7/1/08	11/8/08	343.50
				924.50
Elam, David A.	Counseling Center	11/19/07	5/16/08	313.50
	Student Health Center	1/14/08	5/31/08	315.25
	"	6/1/08	8/29/08	276.00
				904.75
Henning, Sonja L.	Center for Archeological Investigations	6/28/07	9/7/07	304.00
	Curriculum and Instruction	8/24/07	9/10/07	48.00
	"	9/11/07	10/14/07	156.50
	"	10/15/07	1/15/08	367.50
	"	1/16/08	2/14/08	137.00
	"	2/15/08	2/29/08	58.50
				1071.50
Hines, Joshua R.	University Housing	5/11/08	8/9/08	434.00
	Physical Plant Services	5/11/08	8/9/08	77.50
	"	8/11/08	10/28/08	466.00
				977.50
Jenkins, Dwayne S.	Center for Academic Success	1/7/08	6/30/08	908.00

**State Universities Civil Service System
Southern Illinois University Carbondale
FY2010 Compliance Audit**

Appendix B

Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee Name	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Johnson, Betty J.	School of Social Work	4/1/08	6/30/08	93.50
	Student Health Center	5/27/08	9/26/08	603.50
	School of Social Work	7/1/08	3/31/09	148.06
	School of Social Work	8/25/08	3/31/09	654.62
				1499.68
Loss, Susanne L.	School of Social Work	4/21/08	6/30/08	277.15
	"	7/1/08	11/26/08	626.00
				903.15
Loyd, Betty D.	College of Agricultural Sciences	6/14/07	7/3/07	120.00
	"	7/5/07	9/2/07	300.00
	"	9/4/07	11/21/07	427.50
	"	11/24/07	12/4/07	112.50
				960.00
Morris, Angela L.	Rainbow's End	5/12/08	12/7/08	904.55
Rongere, Monica L.	Library Affairs	12/15/08	5/1/09	531.25
	"	5/2/09	6/30/09	263.50
	"	7/1/09	7/31/09	161.00
				955.75
Siphaxay, Mikel A.	Workforce Education and Development	1/7/08	6/30/08	803.00
	"	7/1/08	8/14/08	129.00
				932.00
Smith, Amy D.	ASA Off-Campus Academic Programs	7/19/07	1/31/08	904.50
Svacinova, Veronika	Center for Advanced Friction Studies	12/1/08	5/31/09	975.00

State Universities Civil Service System
Southern Illinois University Carbondale
FY2010 Compliance Audit

Appendix B

Extra Help Employees Exceeding the 900-Hour Rule

Employee Name	Department	Beginning Appointment Date	Ending Appointment Date	Employee Hours Worked
Wheeler, Jeffrey M.	Plant, Soil, & Agricultural Systems	5/16/08	8/16/08	420.00
	"	8/17/08	12/7/08	490.00
				910.00
Wright, Jordan O.	Psychology	8/16/07	12/31/07	667.50
	"	1/1/08	3/3/08	266.30
				933.80